



## **CENTER FOR EURASIAN STUDIES**



## **CENTER FOR EURASIAN STUDIES**



ANKARA January 2018



#### EDITOR

Turgut Kerem Tuncel

#### TRANSLATION

Tutku Dilaver Ahmet Can Öktem Sean Patrick Symth

#### REDACTION

Hülya Önalp

**DESIGN** Ruhi Alagöz

#### PUBLICATION DATE January 2018

#### PRINTING

Neyir Matbaacılık Matbaacılar Sitesi 35. Cad. No: 62 İvedik-Yenimahalle / ANKARA Tel: 0 312 395 53 00 - Faks: 0 312 395 84 20

#### Copyright © AVİM (Center for Eurasian Studies), 2018

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without permission in writing from the Publishers.

To get your own copy of this or any of AVİM publications please visit http://www.avim.org.tr/

# Contents

Foreword	4
Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç, AVİM Director	
Turkey-Armenia Relations in the Year 2017 Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem, AVİM Honorary Presid	
Looking Back at the Last Year	
Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan, AVİM Advisor	
About AVİM	
Activities	
Publications	
AVIM Trainee Program	
Other Activities	103
AVIM Staff	107
A Look Into 2018 Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç, AVİM Director	131
	125
AVIM Publications	135



# Foreword



AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev KILIÇ aving left behind a full and intense year of work in AVIM's sphere of interest, we are pleased to present the Yearly Report in which we provide a general hindsight regarding the year 2017's developments and activities.

Our focus on Eurasia, particularly on Caucasia and the Balkan geography, the wider Black Sea Region, the Caspian basin and Central Asia, which form the major areas of interest of our center, have continued with expanded and deepening activities.

Our close ties with Georgia and Azerbaijan in the South Caucasus have been reflected in our work. The Armenian controversy stemming from the distortion of historical facts and exploited for political calculations is naturally included within our priorities as it creates obstacles to the desired good neighborly relations, to peace, stability and cooperation in the Caucasus. The loss of credibility of the Armenian allegations and claims in the judicial arena is no doubt a source of hope for the future. Nevertheless, the continued search to formulate a new agenda and discourse voiced by

2017 Annual Report



the Armenian authorities at the highest level is an indication that the struggle will continue.

We have also followed the developments in the Balkan geography closely. We have persistently cautioned against the attempts to cast Turkey, an essential component of the Balkans and inseparable part of it, outside the Balkans, with particular concern to the coining of an artificial separation and division in the Balkans.

In addition to the regular publications of our center, the daily bulletin in two languages, *Ermeni Araştırmaları* [Eng. Armenian Studies] journal published three times a year, the *Review of Armenian Studies* journal published twice a year, the annual *Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih* [Eng. International Crimes and History] journal, this autumn the first issue of our biannual *Avrasya Dünyası* [Eng. Eurasian World] journal, has appeared.

In a period when global balances are in transition, Turkey has qualified from being the West's eastern most post to also being the East's western most, moving to the center of the Eurasian geography. With this in mind, AVİM acknowledges the need to develop a new geopolitical and geo-economical perspective with regard to the relations of Turkey as a country at the crossroads of Europe and Asia.

This assessment, on one hand, necessitates the need to progressively sustain traditional relations with the West to the greatest extent possible, on the other it necessitates the need to closely observe and support the developments occurring in Asia and extending to the West. These developments are of a nature to provide opportunities for closer relations with the Central Asian Republics with which Turkey enjoys traditional bonds of historical ties, common language, religion and culture.

AVİM, a nonprofit, neutral and independent think tank, assumes responsibility and has the determination to continue its work with devotion. We extend our gratitude to all individuals and institutions that support our work and publications. I wish to express my gratitude particularly to AVİM's staff, whose devotion and untiring efforts we owe the rising level and quality of our work.



# **Turkey-Armenia Relations**



AVİM Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin LÜTEM

ollowing the collapse of the Soviet Union in 1991, Turkey that had adopted a policy aiming to facilitate the establishment of an environment of stability and cooperation in South Caucasus and the Wider Black Sea Region, had been one of the first countries to recognize Armenia that has taken its place in the world political scene as an independent state. Within this context, Turkey supported Armenia's integration with regional organizations. the international community, Western institutions and organizations, and accordingly Armenia's membership to the Organization of the Black Sea Economic Cooperation as a founding member. In spite of this, necessary conditions that would allow the establishment of diplomatic relations and the development of the bilateral relations between Turkey and Armenia had not been shaped. In the year 1993, Armenia's occupation of Azerbaiian's Kalbaiar region led to the closure of the border between the two countries. With Robert Kocharian's accession to power in 1998, Armenia adopted a policy that was centered around the utilization of the genocide allegations to pressurize and blackmail Turkey. Because of this,



# in the Year 2017

existing hopes and possibilities to improve bilateral relations vanished to a great extent. Although the "football diplomacy" in 2008 and the "Protocols" in 2009 have been important steps for the development of relations between the two countries, in the end the expected outcome was not achieved, and the Turkey-Armenia relations returned to their previous course.

When we look at the course of the Turkey-Armenia relations in 2017, it is possible to say that the relations in this year continue on the trajectory that they were on the previous years and no developments that would give constructive results occurred. Having said that, several noteworthy events should be stated.

In the year 2017, as it has been in previous years, it was seen that Turkey continues to be one of the reference points that was frequently referred to in discussions on different topics in Armenia's public realm, whereas in Turkey's public realm issues regarding Armenia do not occupy much space in the agenda and that these issues do not raise significant interest. This is significant for reflecting the asymmetric perceptions and differences in priorities between the two countries that have been ongoing for years. This can be interpreted as a phenomenon worthy of record for revealing that the perception some circles are trying to install that Armenia and the Armenia-related issue are among Turkey's fundamental issues is unfounded.

In the past year, on various occasions Armenian officials brought up the 2009 Protocols that had already fallen off the agenda in a manner threatening and blaming Turkey and stated that the Protocols would be removed off the agenda. The oddness here is that, as stated, the Protocols are a subject that has fallen off the agenda a long time ago. For this reason, what the Armenian officials sought with such statements has remained a subject open to discussion.

A phenomenon in 2017 that draws attention, although it was also observed in previous years, is that Armenian officials made statements against Turkey on every occasion and on every related or non-related international platform. This situation demonstrates that enmity towards Turkey that has reached irrational le8

vels in Armenia is continuing without pause.

A development connected to this is the rejection of the application made to the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) against Turkey by the Armenian Church Catholicosate of Cilicia located in Lebanon in 2017. The Catholicosate had made this application for the land and buildings located in the Kozan district of Adana that the Catholicosate in 1921 had deserted. As it could be remembered. the Catholicosate applied to the Turkish Constitutional Court in 2015. but this application was rejected due to obvious mispleading. In response, the Catholicosate carried this issue to the ECtHR. It can be stated that the ECtHR's rejection of the Catholicosate's application signifies a new regression regarding the Armenian claims.

It is also worthy to remember some important developments occurred in the US in 2017. The first is the Republican Donald Trump's eventual election as the President. For the active Armenian communities which supported Hillary Clinton throughout the election process, the election of Trump, who displayed a distant attitude towards the Armenian genocide claims, has been a disappointment. In addition, it was observed that after Trump's election as President Armenian organizations revised their pro-Clinton stance in order to maintain their lobbying activities vis-à-vis Trump administration.

Another disappointment for the Armenian organizations in the US was the rejection of Hampig Sassounian's parole by the Governer of California. As known, Hampig Sassounian was a member of the youth branch of the Armenian Revolutionary Federation-Dashnaktsutyun, the Armenian Youth Federation, as well as ARF-Dashnaktsutyun's illegal armed wing lustice Commandos for Armenian Genocide that was active between the 1970-1980's. He is the terrorist who murdered Turkey's Chief Consul Kemal Arıkan on 28 January 1982 in Los Angeles. The rejection of the demand for Hampig Sassounian's parole deprived the ARF-Dashnaksutvun and similar radical organizations from a means of propaganda.

A third development that upset the Armenian lobby is that the hopes for the "Armenian Genocide Museum," that was modelled after the Holocaust Museum opened in 1993 in Washington D.C., and planned to be opened very close to the White House, was put aside due to ownership problems of the museum building. Without a doubt, this means that the radical Armenians have lost another propaganda tool that they very much wanted to acquire.

9

Besides these, it should be noted that Armenian organizations continued their lobby activities to pass "genocide resolutions" in different states in the US, and achieved success in some of them. A museum project similar to the one in Washington is still on the agenda in California to which three million USD was allocated from the state budget. Again in California, the inclusion of the "Armenian genocide" topic into the school curriculum is on the agenda, and a big budget is spared for this.

Lastly, an important issue that should be specified is the discursive change in the propaganda that designates the 1915 events as genocide, which has been conducted for decades using major resources on every platform. For the last several years, after observing that the genocide claims cannot be continued after ECtHR's judgement on Switzerland v. Perincek case and the trials that took place in the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, the "genocide lobby" began to propagate the 1915 events as a crime against humanity. This tendency was observed clearly in 2017. This situation brings forward the possibility that in the coming period a different terminology might be used in the discussions on the 1915 events. In the days ahead, AVIM will take this development into account in its studies.



# Looking Back at the Last Year



AVIM Advisor

Ambassador (R) Yiğit ALPOGAN

ime really flies. The publication of AVİM's 2016 Annual Report almost coincided with the time I began working at AVIM. In my "At the start" titled article in the report of last year, I tried to present what I understood from the new duty I assumed and the roadmap I had in mind to follow in its broad lines. In this context, I emphasized that the importance of Eurasia as a region is to rise continuosly, and that the developments thereof -due to the region's central location- are bound to constantly stay in the forefront.

As an institution, AVİM, has been careful to be explicit and clear in its Eurasian studies about the term Eurasia. When we say "Eurasia" geographically, it covers the broad region between the European Union in the West and China in the East. In this sense, Eurasia consists of the Balkans, the Russian Federation, Ukraine, the Slavic geography such as Belarus and Moldova, and the Wider Black Sea Region, Caucasia, the Central Asian Republics and Mongolia. However, we bear in mind that being restricted to this definition would



create a vacuum in our studies. Thus, due to their locations, economic and military strength, their close relations and communication within the region, special importance is attributed to Iran, Afghanistan, India, Pakistan as well as China, Korea, Japan and ASEAN countries.

Political meaning of Eurasianism from the standpoint of AVIM constitutes the second principle we value. Our understanding of Eurasianism has never embodied that Turkey alter its world view, its system affiliation in political and economic terms, or ultimately change or reshape its military alliance relations. Our view on Eurasia involves being attuned to the world developments and striving to play our role accordingly in line with the traditional parameters of Turkish foreign policy and the framework of Turkey's current contractual and international fundamental choices.

After defining the intellectual framework that would form the basis of AVİM's studies in relation to Eurasia, as regards the practical applications in this scope, one could mention

events and meetings that were jointly organized with some Embassies and Foundations in Ankara especially in the second half of 2017. The interest shown by the diplomatic community in these activities encourages AVIM for new endeavours in 2018. In this regard, another development that should be emphasized is the start of the publication of the Eurasian World magazine of which the first edition was issued in October. We intend to publish our magazine twice a year aiming to convey the comments and assessments of Turkish and foreign intellectuals on the developments in the Eurasian region. *Eurasian World* aims to contribute to the thinking and academic thought in the Balkans, Wider Black Sea Region, Caucasia and Central Asia. As the editor of the magazine, I would like to state that we will always strive to present a magazine that has a high content and scientific value.

On this occasion, I would like to extend my thanks and gratitude to the AVIM administration that has enabled me to contribute to the work of AVIM.

## **About AVIM**

AVIM, founded in 2009, is an independent, non-profit think tank based in Ankara that operates under the umbrella of the Turkmeneli Cooperation and Culture Foundation. AVIM carries out its work with analysts and administrative personnel who are Masters and PhD students or PhD holders.

#### **Our Mission**

AVIM's work and research field consists of Europe, the Balkans, the Wider Black Sea Region, the Caucasus, Central and Eastern Asia. AVIM also seeks to contribute to the understanding of challenges and opportunities that Turkey faces within the changing global geopolitical context. The geopolitical position of Turkey requires utmost attention to the developments in the Eurasian region with two key locations being the Balkans and the Caucasus. For this reason, AVIM focuses on these two regions in its studies. Within this framework, the problematic Turkish-Armenian relations is a subject to which AVİM attributes special importance.

#### **Our Vision**

AVIM envisions building a network of intellectual communication and cooperation among academists and experts on the Eurasian region. In this framework, AVIM collaborates with national and international governmental and non-governmental organizations, independent research institutions and universities, and aims to enhance those partnerships.

#### What We Do

AVIM publishes books and reports based on original research, conference proceedings and policy briefs both in print and electronic format. It organizes national and international conferences and workshops on the political developments in the Eurasian region. In addition to these, AVIM prepares a daily bulletin with news, commentaries and analyses covering the maturing new Eurasia on its website and distributes it via email reaching approximately 7,000 recipients.

AVİM publishes for academic journals, the first three of which are peer-reviewed.

- Ermeni Araştırmaları (in Turkish, since 2001)
- Review of Armenian Studies (in English, since 2002)
- International Crimes and History / Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih (in Turkish and English, since 2006)
- Avrasya Dünyası (in Turkish and English, since 2017)

#### Contact:

Süleyman Nazif Sok. No: 12/B Daire 3-4 06550 Çankaya-ANKARA / TURKEY Tel: +90 (312) 438 50 23-24 · Fax: +90 (312) 438 50 26

🔰 @avimorgtr



https://www.facebook.com/avrasyaincelemelerimerkezi

## www.avim.org.tr

AVİM 2017 Annual Report







#### AVİM organized a conference on 12 January 2017 titled Armenian Demands (Ermeni Talepleri) with AVİM's Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem as the speaker.

**D**uring the course of his speech, AVİM's Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem shared his views on how the claims surrounding what is termed the Armenian genocide are intentionally obscured with terms such as empathy and peace, and how these terms are utilized in a moralistic and emotive manner. Lütem then elaborated upon this by explaining the on-going political and legal campaigns waged by the Republic of Armenia and the Armenian diaspora.

This conference given by Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem was the first in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 View* 



### Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 2

Conference Titled *The Armenian Question According* to the Russian Archives 20 January 2017



#### On 20 January 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *The Armenian Question According to the Russian Archives* (Rus Arşivlerinde Ermeni Meselesi) addressed by Dr. Mehmet Perinçek, Research Assistant at the Istanbul University's Department of History.

**D**r. Mehmet Perinçek, who has written widely on the Armenian question basing his work primarily on his extensive research in the Russian archives, presenting on the theme *The Armenian Question According to the Russian Archives*, evaluated the Armenian claims in light of what the Russian sources say on the matter.

This conference addressed by Dr. Mehmet Perinçek was the second in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 View* 



# **26 January 2017**

Conference Titled *China's Understanding of Threats,* National Security, and Eurasia



#### On 26 January 2017, Retired Major General Ali Erdinç addressed a conference at AVİM titled *China's Understanding of Threats, National Security, and Eurasia* (Çin'in Tehdit Algısı, Güvenlik Stratejisi ve Avrasya).

During the course of his presentation, Retired Major General Ali Erdinç touched upon issues such as the history of the Chinese revolution, China's current understanding of national, regional and global security risks and the tenets of security policies. Retired Major General Ali Erdinç also evaluated China's political, economic and cultural relations with Eurasia in general. In this regard, Retired Major General Ali Erdinç also evaluated relations between Turkey and China in terms of security policies.



AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç's Participation in the Commemoration Ceremony for the International Holocaust Remembrance Day 27 January 2017



#### AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç participated in the Commemoration Ceremony for the *International Holocaust Remembrance Day.*

The United Nations General Council declared 27 January, the anniversary of the liberation of the Auschwitz-Birkenau concentration camps in 1945, as *International Holocaust Remembrance Day* in 2005.

Aimed at increasing awareness of the Holocaust in Turkey, *International Holocaust Remembrance Day* has been commemorated through various events since the year 2011.



3 February 2017

Book Launch: *Türklere Güvendiler – Tarih Boyunca Türk Topraklarına Sığınanlar* (They Trusted the Turks – Those Who Fled to Turkish Lands Throughout History)



#### On 3 February 2017, AVİM hosted the book launch of Ambassador (R) Ender Arat's book Türklere Güvendiler – Tarih Boyunca Türk Topraklarına Sığınanlar (They Trusted the Turks – Those Who Fled to Turkish Lands Throughout History).

**S**erving abroad in Buenos Aires, Bonn, Budapest, Madrid and in the Permanent Representative to the European Union in Brussels during the course of his career, Ambassador (R) Ender Arat had also served as Private Secretary to the Turkish President, Prime Ministerial Foreign Affairs Advisor, and Vice-Undersecretary of the Foreign Ministry's Economic and Cultural Department. At the launch of his 2016 book *Türklere Güvendiler – Tarih Boyunca Türk Topraklarına Sığınanlar (They Trusted the Turks – Those Who Fled to Turkish Lands Throughout History)*, Ambassador (R) Ender Arat spoke on his research relating to the various nationalities, ethnic groups and religions who fled persecution and found refuge in both the Ottoman Empire and Republic of Turkey.

#### 2017 Annual Report

## 19

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 3

Conference Titled *Censoring the Censors: The Final* Defeat of Armenian Nationalism at the French Constitutional Council in January 2017 15 February 2017



On 15 February 2017, AVİM hosted Maxime Gauin, a PhD candidate at the Middle East Technical University's History Department and a Scholar in Residence at AVİM. Maxime Gauin delivered an address titled *Censoring the Censors: The Final Defeat of Armenian Nationalism at the French Constitutional Council in January 2017* (Sansürcülerin Durdurulması: Ermeni Milliyetçiliğinin Ocak 2017'de Fransa Anayasa Konseyi'ndeki Son Yenilgisi).

During the course of his presentation, Maxime Gauin stated that the efforts to have the events of 1915 recognized as genocide by national parliaments is one of the primary goals of the Armenian lobby and secondly these efforts are also intended to silence those who refrain from referring to the events of 1915 as genocide. Maxime Gauin further stated that France was one of the countries in which this situation could be observed most blatantly.

This conference addressed by Maxime Gauin was the third in a series of conferences organized by AVIM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views.* 



22 February 2017

AVİM's Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem's Speech at the Conference Titled *Khojaly Genocide, Crimes Against Humanity and Terrorism* 



AVİM's Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem addressed the event titled *Khojaly Genocide*, *Crimes Against Humanity and Terrorism* held on 22 February 2017 to commemorate the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the "Khojaly genocide" organized jointly by the Turkic Council and Ahmet Yesevi University.

The conference held in Ankara was attended by Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu, Foreign Minister of the Republic of Turkey, Elmar Memmedyarov, Foreign Ministry of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Mikayıl Cabbarov, Minister of Education of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Ahmet Aydın, Deputy Speaker of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey, Ganire Paşayeva, Azerbaijan Member of Parliament, Ramil Hasanov, Turkic Council General Secretary and Ambassador, and Prof. Musa Yıldız, a member of the board of trustees of Ahmet Yesevi University.

In the speech given by Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem, it was mentioned that the failure of the international community to condemn the Khojaly massacre, in addition to the fact that the perpetrators were not brought to justice was one of the reasons why the Srebrenica massacre in Bosnia could not be prevented three years later. Retired Ambassador Ömer Engin Lütem also stressed that a simply condemnation of the Khojaly massacre would be insufficient; for justice to be realized, the perpetrators would need to be brought before an international court. In this regard, Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem argued that compensation would also have to be paid for those who lost their lives in Khojaly.



Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 4

Conference Titled *The Karabakh War Through the* Eyes of a Russian Academic – The First Terrorist War in the History of Humanity 23 February 2017



#### On 23 February 2017, Dr. Oleg Kuznetov spoke at the conference titled The Karabakh War Through the Eyes of a Russian Academic – The First Terrorist War in the History of Humanity organized by AVİM.

**D**uring the course of his speech, Dr. Oleg Kuznetsov discussed the history of the Nagorno-Karabakh region before elaborating upon the war which erupted between Azerbaijan and Armenia over the territory in the 1990s.

This conference addressed by Dr. Oleg Kuznetsov was the fourth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



2 March 2017

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 5

Conference Titled *Materials Used for Perception Management in the Propaganda of Armenian Claims: Immigration and Immigrant Memories* 



On 2 March 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Materials Used* for Perception Management in the Propaganda of Armenian Claims: Immigration and Immigrant Memories (Ermeni İddialarının Propagandasında Algılama Yönetimi İçin Kullanılan Materyaller: Göç ve Göçmen Anıları) addressed by Prof. Birsen Karaca from Ankara University's Language, History and Geography Faculty Department of Armenian Language and Culture.

In her speech, Prof. Birsen Karaca shared her thoughts on the ways in which oral history, micro-history and other similar approaches, which have become popular in recent years in the field of historiography and memoirs, have been instrumentalized in the propagation of the claims surrounding what some researchers term the Armenian genocide.

This conference addressed by Prof. Birsen Karaca was the fifth in a series of conferences organized by AVIM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



Papers Presented by AVİM Analysts at the Panel on the Armenia and the Armenian Issue at Gazi Academy Young Social Scientists Symposium 10 March 2017



On March 9-10 2017, AVİM analysts Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel, Hazel Çağan Elbir and Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun made presentations in the panel titled Armenia and the Armenian Issue (Ermenistan ve Ermeni Meselesi) at Gazi Academy Young Social Scientists Symposium (Gazi Akademi Genç Sosyal Bilimciler Sempozyumu) held at Gazi University.

In the session chaired by Prof. Cemalettin Taşkıran, who in addition to his other publications, jointly authored *Sasun: The History of an 1890s Armenian Revolt* with Justin McCarthy and Ömer Turan, Hazel Çağan Elbir delivered the first speech on Turkish-American relations in the context of the terror campaign conducted by the radical Armenian organizations that targeted Turkish diplomats between the years 1973-1986. The second speaker Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel, made a presentation on the post-Soviet nation and state building in Armenia following the collapse of the Soviet Union and the role the Armenian diaspora played in these processes. Lastly, by providing concrete examples, Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun narrated how the supporters of the genocide thesis seek to falsify the arguments of academics and researchers who reject the genocide label.



# **18 March 2017**

AVİM's Participation in the Commemoration Ceremony Organized by the Ministry Of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey on 18 March Martyrs' Day



# On the occasion of 18 March Martyrs' Day, AVİM staff attended the commemoration ceremony organized by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey.

**D**Affairs at Cebeci Cemetery, a commemoration ceremony was held for Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, his comrades in arms, the soldiers who lost their lives at Gallipoli, Turkish diplomats and other public servants and their family members who were assassinated in terrorist attacks carried out by Armenian and other terror organizations.



## **Conference Titled Global Challenges and the Reactions of Turkey**



#### On 23 March 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Global Challenges and the Reactions of Turkey* (Küresel Sorunlar ve Türkiye'nin Tepkileri) at which Prof. Hüseyin Bağcı from the Middle East Technical University's Department of International Relations was the speaker.

**P**rof. Hüseyin Bağcı, whose research focuses on contemporary international security, European security, German foreign policy and Turkish foreign policy and who has many published books and articles on these subjects, discussed the recent political developments on a global scale and their effects on Turkish foreign policy.



Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 6

Conference Titled Fundamentals Regarding the Legal Assessment of the Demands for the Recognition of the Armenian Genocide and Reparations



On 30 March 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled Fundamentals Regarding the Legal Assessment of the Demands for the Recognition of the Armenian Genocide and Reparations (Ermeni Soykırımını Tanıma ve Hasar Tazmin Taleplerinin Hukuksal Açıdan Değerlendirilmesine İlişkin Esaslar) at which AVİM Science Board Member Ambassador (R) Pulat Tacar was the speaker.

A t the meeting, Ambassador (R) Pulat Tacar presented a legal assessment of the claims for the recognition of the 1915 events as genocide and the demands for reparations which have been subsequently brought forward, and expressed his views on the legal validity of these demands.

This conference addressed by Ambassador (R) Pulat Tacar was the sixth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.

**30 March 201**7



## Conference Titled *Afghanistan and the Political* and Security Landscape in the Region



#### On 4 April 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Afghanistan and the Political and Security Landscape in the Region* at which Hikmet Halil Karzai, the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan was the speaker.

A t the conferece addressed by Hikmet Halil Karzai, who before becoming the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan was tasked with responsibilities in the efforts towards ensuring domestic peace and has published on the issues of security, peace and rapprochement, gave a presentation on the political changes occurring in Afghanistan's immediate neighborhood with a particular focus on the emerging security architecture of the region.



Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 7

Conference Titled *The Van Insurrection and the Zeve Massacre Before the Relocation* 



#### On 7 April 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *The Van Insurrection and the Zeve Massacre Before the Relocation* (Tehcir Öncesi Van İsyanı ve Zeve Katliamı) at which Prof. Cemalettin Taşkıran from Gazi University's Department of International Relations was the speaker.

**P**rof. Taşkıran, the co-author of the books entitled *Sasun: The History of an 1890s Armenian Revolt* and *The Armenian Rebellion at Van* together with Justin McCarthy, Ömer Turan and Esat Arslan, shared the findings of his research conducted on the Van insurrection, which was a turning point with in regards to the decision taken regarding the forced relocation of the Armenians, and the Zeve massacre committed by the Armenian gangs as a part of the insurrection.

This conference addressed by Prof. Cemalettin Taşkıran was the seventh in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç's Presentation at the Meeting on the Subject of Armenia at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey

17 April 2017



# On 17 April 2017, AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç made a presentation at the Meeting on the Subject of Armenia at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey.

**D**uring the course of his presentation, Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç spoke about on the parliamentary elections that took place in Armenia on 2 April 2017, Armenia-Russia relations before and after the elections, and Turkey-Armenia relations.



Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 8

Conference Titled *The Relations Between the Committee of Union and Progress and Dashnaktsutyun During the Second Constitutional Period* 



On 19 April 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *The Relations* Between the Committee of Union and Progress and Dashnaktsutyun During the Second Constitutionalist Period (İkinci Meşrutiyet Döneminde İttihat ve Terakki – Taşnaksutyun İlişkileri) at which Assoc. Prof. Nejla Günay from Gazi University's Department of History Education was the speaker.

At the conference, the disputes, attempts for alliance and divergence between the Committee of Union and Progress and the Armenian Revolutionary Federation - Dashnaktsutyun during the Second Constitutional Period were discussed. Additionally, the Armenian organizations', particularly the Dashnaktsutyun's, relations with other organizations in the Ottoman Empire, and the complicated political environment which began to arise in the eastern provinces were elaborated upon.

This conference addressed by Assoc. Prof. Nejla Günay was the eighth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



## Round Table Meeting Titled *Wider Black Sea Region: Current Stakes and Future Perspectives*



#### On 21 April 2017, AVİM, with the participation of the Romanian Ministry of Foreign Affairs Undersecretary George Ciamba accompanied by a committee from Romania, organized a round table meeting titled *Wider Black Sea Region: Current Stakes and Future Perspectives.*

A t the meeting, Romanian diplomats, Turkish academics and AVİM analysts exchanged their views on security and economy in the Black Sea Region, the Black Sea Economic Cooperation Organization, and the ways to improve cooperation among the countries in the region.



## Conference Titled Montenegro and the Balkans



#### On April 25 2017, AVİM in cooperation with International, Political and Economic Relations Research Center at Ankara University's Political Science Faculty and the Montenegro Friendship Association organized a conference titled *Montenegro and the Balkans* (Karadağ ve Balkanlar).

A long with former parliamentarian and Montenegro Bosniac Party Political Director Prof. Suljo Mustafic, who gave a speech as the honorary guest, Prof. Çınar Özen from Ankara University's Department of International Relations, President of the Montenegro Friendship Association President Ambassador (R) Murat Oğuz, and AVİM Consultant Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan delivered speeches. During the course of the meeting, which was attended by representatives of diplomatic missions, the academic community and think tanks, Montenegro's relations with the European Union and NATO were discussed, alongside the issues of Turkey-Montenegro bilateral relations, the recent elections in Montenegro and Montenegro's foreign policy



Speech delivered by AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç at the Conference Titled *The Past, Today, Future of the Armenian Question*  26 April 2017



On 26 April 2017, AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç delivered a speech at the conference titled *The Past, Today, Future of the Armenian Question* organized (Ermeni Meselesi: Dünü, Bugünü, Yarını) at Yıldırım Beyazıt University.

A cademics from various universities have also made presentations at the conference regarding the different topics of the Armenian Question.



Papers Presented by AVİM Analyst Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun and AVİM Scholar in Residence Maxime Gauin at the Symposium Titled *Turkish-Armenian Relations in the Centennial of the Parting of the Ways* 



#### On 27 April 2017, AVİM Analyst Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun and AVİM Guest Researcher Maxime Gauin presented papers at the Symposium Titled *Turkish-Armenian Relations in the Centennial of the Parting of the Ways* (Yol Ayrımının 100. Yılında Türk-Ermeni İlişkileri) at Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam Universty.

VİM Analyst Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun presented a paper titled Armenian Demands from Turkey (Ermenilerin Türkiye'den Talepleri) prepared by the AVİM Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem. In the presentation, Armenian claims regarding the 1915 events and Armenian request from Turkey were discussed.

Maxime Gauin, in his presentation titled *Occupation of Maraş by French and Armenian Forces* (1919-1920) in Historical Context (Tarihi Bağlamında Maraş'ın Fransız ve Ermeni Kuvvetler Tarafından İşgali (1919-1920)) in which he assessed the relations between the French and the Armenian volunteer troops during the French occupation in and around Maraş.



Speech Delivered by AVİM Senior Analyst Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel at the Conference Organized at Giresun University with the Title *Armenian Diaspora Activities and Notes for Turkey*  **3 May 2017** 



On 3 May 2017AVİM Senior Analyst Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel, as the invitee of Giresun University's Strategic Research Society participated as speaker in the conference titled *Armenian Diaspora Activities and Notes for Turkey* (Ermeni Diaspora Faaliyetleri ve Türkiye için Notlar) and in this context came together with the academic staff and students of Giresun University.

**D**uring the course of his speech, Dr. Tuncel shared his views on the identification of the necessary tools that are instrumental for the analytical understanding of the Armenian diaspora which is generally perceived as an integrated whole. Touching upon the advancement and transformation practices of Armenian communities in different countries in the course of 20<sup>th</sup> century, Dr. Tuncel stated that one of the most important causes for diasporic elites to bring forward the "genocide cause" starting from 1960s was to prevent the assimilation process.


[1-12 May 2017

1915 Events and Law Workshops - 5

Workshop Titled 1915 Events and Law: Possible Initiatives and Counter Measures



## On 11-12 May 2017, AVİM, in cooperation with İnönü University in Malatya organized the fifth leg of the series of 1915 Events and Law Workshops with the title 1915 Events and Law: Possible Initiatives and Counter Measures.

Within the context the workshop which is organized with the participation of academics from law faculties of various universities, legal specialists, and AVİM analysts, first, international law, private arrangements, law of armed conflicts, and Ottoman law were deliberated upon in the session titled *Legal Order Applicable to 1915 Events* (1915 Olaylarına Uygulanacak Hukuk).

In the second session titled *Lawsuits Might be Filed Regarding 1915 Events* (1915 Olayları Hakkında Açılabilecek Davalar) legal processes which might be developed regarding the subject matter in Turkish, foreign national and international courts were discussed.





In the third and the final session, previous lawsuits handled in the European Court of Human Rights were examined. In this session, the Constitutional Court Verdict of 15 June 2016 regarding the Armenian Catholicosate of Cilicia application was also analyzed.

The workshop titled 1915 Events and Law: Possible Initiatives and Counter Measures constitutes the fifth leg of the 1915 Events and Law workshop series, the first of which was organized in cooperation with Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University on 8-9 October 2015.





**13 May 2017** 

Participation of AVİM Analysts Hazel Çağan Elbir and Özge Nur Öğütcü in the Turkish Foreign Policy Workshop



AVİM analysts Hazel Çağan Elbir and Özge Nur Öğütcü participated in the *Turkish World and Turkish Foreign Policy* (Türk Dünyası ve Türk Dış Politikası) Workshop organized by The Turkish World Parliamentary Association on 13 May 2017.

A t the workshop at which two commissions on economic and social/cultural areas were established, the common problems of the Turkic republics and the possible solutions to various issues were evaluated. Hazel Çağan Elbir and Özge Nur Öğütcü shared their views on these subjects with the other participants.



Paper Presented by AVİM Senior Analyst Aslan Yavuz Şir at the Workshop Titled *Pontus Question with its Historical Background* Organized at Karadeniz Technical University 15 May 2017



On 15 May 2017, AVİM Senior Analyst Aslan Yavuz Şir presented a paper titled *Pontus Question and Hate Speech* (Pontus Meselesi ve Nefret Söylemi) at the Conference Organized by the Karadeniz Technical University with the Title *Pontus Question with its Historical Background* (Tarihsel Arka Planıyla Pontus Meselesi).

The workshop which is organized on the 15 May 2017 at the Karadeniz Technical University Osman Turan Cultural Center is carried out with the participation of 17 academics who presented papers in five sessions. During the workshop, the Pontus question was evaluated in terms of both a historical and political perspective by various academics who are specialists on the subject matter. The event was considered the preliminary leg of the further studies in Turkey on this issue.



17 May 2017

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 9

Conference Titled *Legislating Reality and Politicizing History: Contextualizing Armenian Claims of Genocide and Responses to the Campaign* 



On 17 May 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled Legislating Reality and Politicizing History: Contextualizing Armenian Claims of Genocide and Responses to the Campaign (Gerçeği Yasalaştırma ve Tarihi Siyasileştirme: Ermeni Soykırım İddialarının Çerçevelendirilmesi ve Kampanyaya Verilecek Cevaplar) at which Assist. Prof. Brendon J. Cannon, faculty member of Khalifa University's Institute of International & Civil Security was the speaker.

A ssist. Prof. Brendon J. Cannon's book titled Legislating Reality and Politicizing History: Contextualizing Armenian Claims of Genocide and Responses to the Campaign was





published in 2016. It examines the connection of the promotion of the 1915 events as part of a campaign for genocide recognition with the formation of contemporary Armenian identity.

This conference addressed by Assist. Prof. Brandon J. Cannon was the ninth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



**25 May 2017** 

Participation of AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç and AVİM Analysts Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel and Özge Nur Öğütcü in the Conference Titled 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Relations



On 25 May 2017 AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç and AVİM Analysts Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel and Özge Nur Öğütcü participated in the round table session held following the panel at the conference titled 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Relations organized by the Center for Strategic Research of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Embassy of Ukraine in Ankara.

In the conference, attended by Turkish and Ukrainian diplomats and specialists, presentations were made regarding the political and economic relations of the two countries, and in the round table session views were exchanged on the subject matter.

2017 Annual Report

43

25 May 2017

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 10

Conference Titled The Image of Turks in Armenian Textbooks



On 25 May 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *The Image of Turks in Armenian Textbooks* (Ermeni Tarih Ders Kitapları ve Türk İmgesi) at which Assoc. Prof. Yıldız Deveci Bozkuş, the Head of Yıldırım Beyazıt University's Armenian Language and Literature Department, was the speaker.

A ssoc. Prof. Yıldız Deveci Bozkuş, who authored the book titled *Turks in Armenian Textbooks* published in 2016, shared her views and made comments on the data collected through the examination of the texts concerning Turkey and Turks included in the history textbooks used in Armenian schools by way of which image formation on Turkey and Turks.

This conference addressed by Assoc. Prof. Yıldız Deveci Bozkuş was the tenth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.



**8 June 2017** 

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 11

Conference Titled *Turkish and Armenian Civilian* Losses in the First World War and Measures Taken During the Armenian Relocation



## On 8 June 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Turkish and* Armenian Civilian Losses in the First World War and Measures Taken During the Armenian Relocation (Birinci Dünya Savaşı'ndaki Türk ve Ermeni Sivil Kayıpları ve Ermeni Göçleri Sırasında Uygulanan Tedbirler) at which Dr. Ömer Lütfi Taşçıoğlu was the speaker.

**D**r, Ömer Lütfi Taşçıoğlu, author of the book titled *Türk-Ermeni İlişkilerinde Tarihi, Siyasi ve Hukuki Gerçekler* (Historical, Political and Legal Realities in the Turkish-Armenian Relations) published in 2015, after drawing a general framework on the events of 1915 discussed the measures taken by Ottoman officials to prevent loss of lives during the relocations and shared the findings of his research on both Turkish and Armenian civilian losses during the First World War.

This conference addressed by Dr. Ömer Lütfi Taşçıoğlu was the eleventh in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.

AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç's Attendance at the Conference Titled *The South Caucasus in the International Arena: Cooperation and Competition in and around the Region*  15-17 June 2017



AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç delivered a speech at the conference titled *The South Caucasus in the International Arena: Cooperation and Competition in and around the Region* organized by the Azerbaijan Center for Strategic Studies in Baku on 15-17 June 2017.

**D**uring the course of the conference diplomats and specialists from various countries expressed their views concerning the current political and economic developments in the Southern Caucasus and the possible outcomes of these developments.



28-29 June 2017

Speech Delivered by AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç at the Titled *Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia NGO Forum* 



## AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç delivered a speech at the Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia NGO Forum in China's capital Beijing on 28-29 June 2017.

In his speech at the conference attended by high level participants such as Dr. Essam Abdel Aziz Sharaf, former Prime Minister of Egypt, Lee Hae Chan, former Prime Minister of the Republic of Korea and Jose de Venecia, former Spokesman of Philippine Parliament, Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç elaborated upon security issues in Asia.

The Meeting Between AVİM Analysts and the Representatives of Taipei Economic and Cultural Mission and the Association of Taiwan Central Asia Studies 20 July 2017



#### On 20 July 2017, AVİM analysts had a meeting with the representatives of Taipei Economy and Culture Mission and Chien-Yu Shih, Secretary-General of the Association of Taiwan Central Asia Studies.

At the meeting that took place at AVİM, the issues of Central Asia, Turkey-China Relations, the One Belt One Road Initiative and Turkey's policies relating to Central Asia were discussed.



Participation of the AVİM Analyst Özge Nur Öğütcü in the Meeting in Almaty Titled *Top Security Concerns in Central Asia* 



## AVİM Analyst Özge Nur Öğütcü participated in the meeting titled Top Security Concerns in Central Asia on 2-4 August 2017 organized by Washington based Near East South Asia Center for Strategic Studies and Almaty based Central Asia Institute for Strategic Studies.

A t the meeting in which specialists from the Central Asian republics, America, Germany, Ukraine and Turkey participated, developments in Central Asia and the effects of the exterritorial actors on these events were discussed. At the meeting, AVİM Analyst Özge Nur Öğütcü delivered a presentation on Turkey-Central Asia relations.



Consultation Meeting between AVİM Analysts and Günay Evinch, the Co-President of the *Turkish American National Steering Committee* (TASC) 8 August 2017



#### On 8 August 2017, a consultation meeting was held between AVİM Analysts and the Co-President of Turkish American National Steering Committee Günay Evinch.

At the meeting, the social conditions of the Turkish community in the United States and the developments in Turkish-Armenian relations were discussed.





On 16 September 2017, AVİM Analyst Özge Nur Öğütcü evaluated the state of Turkey-Kazakhstan relations and Kazakhstan's regional policies on the *Strait Talk* program broadcast by TRT World.

## 2017 Annual Report 51

Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views – 12

Conference Titled Normalization of the Turkish-Armenian Relations and Assessments of the Approaches to the Karabakh Conflict in Armenia



On 28 September 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled Normalization of the Turkish-Armenian Relations and Assessments of the Approaches to the Karabakh Conflict in Armenia (Türk-Ermeni İlişkilerinin Normalleşmesi ve Karabağ Sorununa Ermenistan'daki Bakışlar Üzerine Değerlendirmeler) at which Prof. Gaffar Çakmaklı Mehdiyev from Erciyes University's Department of Eastern Languages and Literature was the speaker.

At the conference, Prof. Gaffar Çakmaklı assessed the past and the future of Turkish-Armenian relations. Prof. Çakmaklı examined the protocols in 2009 which aimed to guarantee the normalization of diplomatic relations between Turkey and Armenia and approaches of both ruling party and opposition parties in Armenia, and non-governmental organizations, relating to the matter. In this regard, Prof. Gaffar Çakmaklı Mehdiyev discussed how different actors in Armenia and the diaspora evaluate the relationship between Turkey and Azerbaijan and their respective perspectives on Karabakh Question.

This conference addressed by Prof. Gaffar Çakmaklı Mehdiyev was the twelfth in a series of conferences organized by AVİM that aim to assess the relationship between Turks and Armenians titled *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*.





On 12 October 2017, AVİM held a meeting to launch the book titled *The Big Lie* authored by Şükrü Server Aya

In the meeting Şükrü Server Aya, author of *Soykırım Tacirleri ve Gerçekler*; *The Genocide of Truth*, and *Twisted Law versus Documented History* among other books and many articles, shared the findings of his most recent research projects and documents with the audience relating to the 1915 events that are presented in his new book *The Big Lie*, which was published in Turkish, English and German.





#### On 26 October 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Turkey and Russia in Historical Perspective* at which former academic at Cambridge, Oxford and Bilkent universities Prof. Norman Stone was the speaker.

**P**rof. Norman Stone who has published many articles in various newspapers such as *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* and *The Wall Street Journal* for many years, served as the foreign affairs adviser of United Kingdom's Prime Minister Margaret Thatcher. Prof. Stone also established the Center for Russian Studies at Bilkent University in addition to his previous academic career at Cambridge and Oxford universities. In his speech, Prof. Stone evaluated the relationships between Turkey and Russia in terms of current developments with an emphasis on its historical background.

The conference was attended by many of the diplomatic corps in Ankara as well as, think tank specialists, academics and students.



Conference Titled International Conference for Students and Young researchers on 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Diplomatic Relations



On 3-4 November 2017, AVİM in cooperation with Karabük University, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, and the Embassy of Ukraine in Ankara organized a conference titled International Conference for Students and Young researchers on 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Diplomatic Relations.

A t the conference, following the opening remarks delivered by the Ambassador of Ukraine in Ankara Andrii Sybiha, the Rector of Karabük University Prof. Refik Polat, Assoc. Prof. Ihor Urak from Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, and the AVİM Director Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç, Turkish and young Ukrainian social scientists delivered presentations that evaluated relations between two countries.



Conference Titled *Politics in Yugoslavia's* Successor States A Quarter Century Later: Past Experiences Future Challenges 8 November 2017



On 8 November 2017, AVİM organized a conference titled *Politics in Yugoslavia's Successor States A Quarter Century Later: Past Experiences Future Challenges* in cooperation with TOBB Economy and Technology University Department of Political Science and International Relation, and Montenegro Friendship Association, at which Dr. Ivan Vukoviç was the speaker.

**F**ollowing opening remarks delivered by Prof. Birgül Demirtaş and AVİM President Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç, Dr. Ivan Vukoviç evaluated the current political situation in Balkans after he elaborated upon the foundation, structure and disintegration process of Yugoslavia Federal Socialist Republic.



## Conference Titled *Turkey and Korea: Two Bridgeheads in the Thriving Eurasia*



## AVİM jointly organized a conference with the Embassy of the Republic of Korea and the Korea Institute for National Unification. The conference held on 29 November 2017 was titled *Turkey and Korea: Two Bridgeheads in the Thriving Eurasia.*

The opening remarks were delivered by the Republic of Turkey's ambassador to the Republic of Korea, Ersin Erniç and the ambassador of the Republic of Korea to Turkey, Yunsoo Cho in which they touched upon developments in Eurasia, security in North East Asia and North Korea's nuclear ambitions. The second panel analyzed developments in Central Asia, the Northern Caucasus and the Middle East, in addition to discussing the relations between Turkey and the Republic of Korea.



## Conference Titled Security, Stability, and **Cooperation in the Wider Black Sea Region**



## On 4 December 2007, AVİM jointly organized a conference titled Security, Stability, and Cooperation in the Wider Black Sea Region with Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung.

*T* ith the participation of specialists and academics from Albania, Azerbaijan, Armenia, Goergia, Moldova, Romania, the Russian Federation, Ukraine, Serbia and Turkey, three panels titled Energy Politics in the Wider Black Sea Region, Hard Security Issues in the Wider Black Sea Region and Wider Black Sea Region and Regional Cooperation and Integration: Opportunities and Challenges delivered the findings of their research. After the panels, the conference concluded with an evaluation session.



Conference Titled 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Diplomatic Relations: Regional Developments and Prospects for Enhanced Cooperation



On 12 December 2017, in cooperation with the Middle East Technical University's Eurasian Studies Program and the Embassy of the Republic of Ukraine, AVİM organized a panel titled 25 Years of Turkey-Ukraine Diplomatic Relations: Regional Developments and Prospects for Enhanced Cooperation.

The opening remarks were delivered by Andrii Sybiha, Ambassador of Ukraine, and Ş. Vural Altay, the head of the Turkish Foreign Ministry's Eastern European, Caucasian and Central Asian political relations section. Presentations were then made by Assistant Prof. Anar Somuncuoğlu of Hacettepe University, Associate Prof. Sergii V. Glebov of Odessa Mechnikov National University's Department of International Relations and Fethi Kurtiy Şahin of METU's Social Sciences Institute. These presentations examined the transport corridors of the wider Black Sea region, security issues in the region, the annexation of Crimea by Russia and the current situation of the Crimean Tatars.



AVİM Senior Analyst Aslan Yavuz Şir's Seminar Titled The Nagorno Karabakh Question: Actors and Suggestions for Resolution



On 22 December 2017, AVİM Senior Analyst Aslan Yavuz Şir gave a seminar titled *The Nagorno Karabakh Question: Actors and Suggestions for Resolution* as the guest of UNESCO Chair for Education for Sustainable Peace at the Istanbul Aydın University.

**D** uring the course of the seminar, Aslan Yavuz Şir evaluated historical, legal and political foundations of the problems in Nagorno-Karabakh, which have been continuing for a quarter century. Şir further assessed the latest political developments and attempts for the resolution of the conflict.

## AVİM 2017 Annual Report

# **Publications**

\* AVİM Conference Proceedings and AVİM Reports are available online on AVİM's website. It is also possible to access past issues, excluding the latest ones, of the academic journals published by AVİM, namely, *Ermeni Araştırmaları*, *Review of Armenian Studies*, and *Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih / International Crimes and History*. The printed versions of these journals and books published by AVİM are available at book stores. You can also contact AVİM in order to obtain these publications.



## **Daily Bulletin**





## **AVİM Daily Bulletin**

**A**VİM Daily Bulletin AVİM publishes books and reports based on original research, conference books that include conference proceedings and presentations, and three peer-reviewed academic journals, namely, *Ermeni Araştırmaları, Review of Armenian Studies and Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih / International Crimes and History*. In addition, commentaries and analyses by AVİM analysts on developments in the Eurasian region are accessible on AVİM's website. Commentaries/analyses and interviews by the AVİM staff published in different media organs, articles written by outside researchers for AVİM, and articles published in different outlets covering AVİM's research areas are published on the AVİM Blog, which can be accessed also through AVİM website.

One of AVİM's publication activities is the AVİM Daily Bulletin, which is prepared with the aim of providing its followers with news on current developments in the Caucasus, the Balkans, Asia, Europe and Iraq. AVİM Daily Bulletin, which includes commentaries and analyses by AVİM analysts, announcements and events news, articles published in AVİM Blog as well as news compiled from Turkish and foreign press, is distributed daily via email reaching currently to approximately 7000 recipients.

Considering that it is an important means that facilitates being up to date with developments in the Caucasus, the Balkans, Asia, Europe and Iraq, AVİM will continue to publish the AVİM Daily Bulletin in 2018.



# Book





## Ermeni Konferansları 2016

(Armenian Conferences 2016)

Editor: Ömer Engin Lütem Date of Publication: May 2017 Language: Turkish ISBN: 978-605-82518-2-3 (Paperback, 168 pages)

Within the years 2014, 2015, and 2016, that is to say the years surrounding the 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the relocation of Ottoman Armenians during the First World War, numerous books and articles that aim to sustain the genocide thesis were published and many meetings that propagated the same view were organized. On the other hand, the number of the studies that challenge that thesis remained limited during the same period. Likewise, the number of meetings at which similar oppositional stance was elaborated upon did not reach the expected level.

This suggests that academics, writers and think tanks that have the courage to approach the issue from alternative angles should be more active. Essentially, it is not difficult to bring to realization. There are scholars who know the Armenian question historically and legally very well, and diplomats who have successfully participated in discussing this issue in various international platforms.

AVİM organized a series of conferences in 2016 to benefit from the knowledge and thoughts of these specialists. This book titled *Armenian Conferences 2016 is* composed of the texts of the presentations of ten academics, writers and diplomats with knowledge and experience in the Armenian question who gave conferences at AVİM in 2016.



# Journals





## ERMENİ ARAŞTIRMALARI

**E***rmeni Araştırmaları* (Armenian Studies) was started in 2001 with the aim of publishing academic research and promoting inter-disciplinary debate among academics and researchers on issues within the scope of Armenian Studies. As a peer reviewed journal *Ermeni Araştırmaları* is published three-times a year. Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem is the editor and Aslan Yavuz Şir is the managing editor of *Ermeni Araştırmaları. Ermeni Araştırmaları* is indexed by EBSCO and TÜBİTAK/ULAKBİM.

*Ermeni Araştırmaları* accepts submissions on a range of subjects that include Armenian politics, history, culture, socio-political developments in Armenia, regional and international politics of Armenia, Armenia-Turkey- relations, Armenia-Iran relations, Armenia's relations with the states in the Caucasus, Armenia-US relations, and Armenia-EU relations. Previous issues include contributions of prominent scholars such as Justin McCarthy, Guenter Lewy, Edward Erickson, Norman Stone and Jeremy Salt.

In 2017, 56th, 57th, and 58th issues of Ermeni Araştırmaları were published.

#### Ermeni Araştırmaları, Issue 56

The 56<sup>th</sup> issue of *Ermeni Araştırmaları* includes six articles, an archive document and a book review. First of these is Ömer Engin Lütem's *Olaylar ve Yorumlar* (Facts and Comments). In this article, Lütem evaluates the stagnation period in Turkey-Armenia relations, and developments with regard to Armenian genocide allegations in some countries that are in line with the Armenian perspective, and its negative effects on Turkey's relations with these countries such as Germany.

Nejla Günay in her article titled *Rusya'nın Osmanlı ve İran Topraklarındaki Ermeniler ve Kürt Aşiretleriyle İlişkisi* (Russia's Relations with Armenians and Kurds in the Ottoman Empire and Iran) analyzes the incitement of Armenians and Kurds against each other, arming and using them against Ottoman Empire at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century when state was in an increasingly fragile condition, all of which took place in the frame of Russia's traditional policy of gaining access to the warm waters.

Onur Okyar in his article titled *Uluslararası İlişkiler Perspektifinden Nahçıvan Üzerine Eleştirel Bir Bakış: Sorun mu Fırsat mı*? (A Critical Overview on Nakhchivan from the International Relations Perspective: Is It a Problem or an Opportunity?)



presents an evaluation of the Nakhichevan problem through theoretical methods and shares the findings of the field study which were conducted by the researcher at some universities in Tehran .

Halil Özşavlı in his article titled *Osmanlı Kroniklerinde Ermeniler* (Armenians in the Ottoman Chronicles) analyzes events and information about Armenians in twelve Ottoman chronicles. He shows that these Ottoman chronicles included detailed information about Ottoman Armenians in various fields, especially in reference to political and military events.

Arzu Boy in her article titled *Mondros Mütarekesinden 1920'ye Kadar Kars ve Çevresinde Ermenilerin Gasp Ettiği Mallar* (The Properties Seized by the Armenians in Kars and the Surroundings as of the Armistice of Mudros Until 1920) gives information about the villages which were destroyed by Armenian attacks in and around Kars. Boy shows that these attacks continued until the Armenian forces were defeated and the Treaty of Gümrü was signed.

Deniz Akçay in her article titled *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti/Osmanlı Devleti ve Ardıllık/Devamlılık Sorunsalının Görelileşmesi* (Republic Of Turkey/Ottoman Empire and the Relativization of the Question of Succession/Continuity of States) presents a detailed analysis of the basic arguments regarding Ottoman Empire's continuity with the Republic of Turkey. The theses that deal with whether Republic of Turkey is a continuing state of the Ottoman Empire are often discussed in relation with the Armenian issue. Deniz Akçay's article shows how some of the widely referred articles on the Lausanne Treaty are misinterpreted, some others altogether ignored, and how the deficient and partial arbitral decision is far from providing a substantial and legitimate basis that will support the argument that Turkey is the continuing state of the Ottoman state.

The 56<sup>th</sup> Issue of Ermeni Araştırmaları also includes an archive document titled *Armenians and Iran*, which was retranslated by Assoc. Prof. Ali Asker and Dr. Könül Hacıyeva, written by well-known Azerbaijani politician Mirza Bala Mehmetzade (1898-1959) and published by National Azerbaijani Publication in 1927 in Istanbul.

Book Review section includes a review of İbrahim Çağlar's book titled *Armenian-Turkish Dictionary* by Güzin Çaykıran. After the Armenian-Turkish dictionary written by Prof Dr. Birsen Karaca in 2001, İbrahim Çağlar's dictionary shows that the interest in Armenian language is increasing.



#### Ermeni Araştırmaları, Issue 57

The 57<sup>th</sup> issue of *Ermeni Araştırmaları* includes five articles and two reports. First of these articles titled *Olaylar ve Yorumlar* (Facts and Comments) by Ömer Engin Lütem deals with developments in Turkey- Armenia relations during April, June and July 2017. Lütem also evaluates President Erdoğan's message that was sent to Turkey's Armenians and the commemorations of April 24<sup>th</sup> in Turkey, as well as in Armenia. Lastly, Lütem presents an analysis of the developments concerning Armenian Question in U.S., France and in some other countries.

Taner Aslan in his article titled *Ermeni Patriği Arsevik Nerses II. Varjabedyan'ın Fransız Büyükelçisine Sunduğu Rapor* (Report Submitted to the French Ambassador by the Armenian Patriarch Arsevik Nerses II. Varjabedyan) deals with the report that was signed by the "Patriarch in Istanbul" dated 6 June 1880, in which Patriarch Nerses asks for support from the French Ambassador for the implementation of the reforms highlighting the Article 61 of the Berlin Treaty, and which includes demographic statistics aimed to mislead European public opinion.

Oleg Kuznetsov in his article titled 1988-1994 Dağlık Karabağ Savaşı – İnsanlık Tarihinin İlk Terörist Savaşı (Nagorno-Karabakh War 1988-1994 – First Terrorist War in History) evaluates in detail the crimes against humanity and terrorist acts by the Armenian separatists during the war in Nagorno Karabakh.

Yasemin Türkkan Tunalı's article titled *İspanyol Diplomatik Raporlarında Ermeni Sorunu Algısı (1914-1922)* (The Perception of Armenian Question in the Spanish Diplomatic Reports (1914-1922)) analyzes Spanish diplomatic archive documents to reveal how Spanish diplomats perceived "Armenian question" as representatives of a country that was not directly involved with and had no direct interest in the "Armenian question" at that particular period,

Hasan Demirci in his article titled *Ermenistan Harekâtı Sırasında Arpaçay'ın Batısında Ermeni Mezâlimi ve Tahribâtı (1920)* (Armenian Atrocities and Destructions in the West of Arpaçay During Turkish Army's Offensive against Armenia (1920)) analyzes the extent of atrocities and destruction by the Armenian forces west of Arpaçay that were retrieving in the face of Turkish Army's offensive lead by General Kazım Karabekir in 1920 in the light of archive documents.

In this issue, there are two reports under a special dossier titled Armenian Issue from the Perspective of International Law. The first report written by Deniz Akçay is titled *Ermeni Vakıflarına İlişkin Avrupa İnsan Hakları Mahkemesi'nin Kararları* (European Court Of Human Rights judgments on Armenian Foundations). The second report written by Pulat Tacar is titled *Ermeni Soykırımını Tanıma ve Hasar* 



*Tazmin Taleplerinin Hukuksal Açıdan Değerlendirilmesine İlişkin Esaslar* (Principles on the Legal Analysis of Armenian Demands for Recognition of the Armenian Genocide Allegations and Compensation).

#### Ermeni Araştırmaları, Issue 58

The 58<sup>th</sup> issue of Ermeni Araştırmaları includes five articles and two book reviews. First of these articles titled *Olaylar ve Yorumlar* (Facts and Comments) by Ömer Engin Lütem deals with Armenian President Serzh Sarkissian's speeches at the 6th Pan-Armenian Armenia- Diaspora Conference and at the UN General Assembly, Armenia's search for a new strategy towards the recognition of genocide allegations and their impact on Armenia-diaspora relations, a decision of the European Court of Human Rights on Antelias Armenian Patriarchate's appeal for the return of properties in Turkey, tensions between Turkey and Germany in the light of support to Armenian allegations through a series of meetings, and lastly Namibia and two Namibian tribes' claims for recognition and compensation from Germany.

Ebru Çoban Öztürk in her article titled Çatışma Sürekliliği ve Çözülemeyen/İnatçı Çatışma Kavramı Çerçevesinde 1915 Olayları, Yeni Sorunlar ve Uzlaşma (1915 Events, New Issues and Reconciliation within the Framework of Persistence of Conflict and the Concept of Intractable Conflict) argues that it is necessary to focus not only on the embedded problems but also on the socio-psychological sources of intractable/persistent conflicts to be able to initiate progress between Turkish and Armenian societies.

Yıldız Deveci Bozkuş in her article titled *Parlamento Kararlarının Alındığı Dönemde İngiliz Basını (1982-2007)* (British Press During Parliamentary Decisions On The Armenian Issue (1982-2007)) evaluates British press in Directorate General of Press and Information of the Republic of Turkey Office of the PM archives between 1982-2007 and presents detailed information on the frequency and timing of increase or decrease in the news on Armenian issue, the reasons behind these trends and the content of these articles.

Hülya Eraslan in her article titled *Ermeni Basını Ve Osmanlı Bankası Baskını* (1896): Ceride-İ Şarkiye ve İravunk Gazeteleri Arasındaki "Vazife-İ Sadakat" Ve "Vazife-İ İhanet" Tartışması (Armenian Press and Ottoman Bank Raid (1896): Discussion on "Duty of Loyalty" and "Duty of Betrayal" Between Ceride-I Şarkiye and Iravunk Newspapers) analyzes how two Armenian newspapers, namely liberal Ceride-i Şarkiye and revolutionary İravunk addressed the events during and after the 1896 Ottoman Bank Raid committed by the Dashnak Committee in Istanbul.



Doğanay Eryılmaz in her article titled *Birinci Dünya Savaşı Anılarında Ermeni Çeteleri* (Armenian Gangs in World War I Memoirs) evaluates how World War I Armenian memoirs depict Armenian gang activities. Eryılmaz shows how memoirs praise Armenian gang activities while demeaning Turkish image, and how such an approach is evident of the propagandist aims of World War I discourses in Armenian literature.

The 58<sup>th</sup> issue also includes two book reviews. The first review of the book Yoldaş Pançuni: Yoldaş Pançuni'den Sosyalist Mektuplar by Yervant Odyan (Comrade Panchoonia (Enger Panchoonie): Socialist Letters from Comrade Panchoonia) is written by Mehmet Mert Çam. Second book review is written by Tutlu Dilaver on the book Güney Kafkasya Kökenli Öğrencilerin Türkiye'ye Gelmeden Önceki ve Geldikten Sonraki Türkiye Algılarının Değişimi (The Perception of Southern Caucasian Students on Turkey Before and After Their Arrival In Turkey) authored by Yıldız Deveci Bozkuş and Eda Bekçi Arı.






#### **REVIEW OF ARMENIAN STUDIES**

The Review of Armenian Studies is a biannual academic journal. The journal was established with the aim of publishing academic papers on Armenian Studies and to stimulate inter-disciplinary debate between academics and others on topics relating to the said academic field. The journal's language is English. Honorary President of AVİM Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem serves as the editor of the journal, while AVİM Analyst Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun serves as its managing editor. The journal is indexed by EBSCO and the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey-Turkish Academic Network and Information Center (TUBİTAK-ULAKBİM).

In the works that it publishes, the *Review of Armenian Studies* examines the following subject matters:

- The Armenian revolts in the 19th and 20th century era of the Ottoman Empire

- Historical, political, and social dimensions of the 1915 events
- Various aspects of the dispute over the 1915 events
- Politics in the Armenian world (in Armenia and in the Armenian diaspora)

- Culture and society in the Armenian world (in Armenia and in the Armenian diaspora)

- Bilateral relations of Armenia with other countries
- Regional and international politics of Armenia

Since 2001, 36 issues of the *Review of Armenian Studies* have been published including the two latest issues published in 2017.

#### Review of Armenian Studies, Issue 35

The 35<sup>th</sup> issue of the *Review of Armenian Studies* contains five articles and two book reviews.



The first article in the 35<sup>th</sup> issue of the journal, penned by Ömer Engin Lütem, is *Facts and Comments*. This article examines Turkish-Armenian relations during the first half of 2017. The article additionally looks at President of Turkey Recep Tayyip Erdoğan's message to Turkey's citizens of Armenian heritage, 24 April commemorations in Turkey and elsewhere, and developments concerning the "Armenian question" in certain countries such as the US and France.

In the article titled *The Advanced Stage of Russia-Armenia Military Cooperation: The Joint Military Force*, Ali Asker analyzes the nature and the content of the close military cooperation between Russia and Armenia ever since the latter's independence after the dissolution of the Soviet Union. The author also analyzes the most recent culmination of this close cooperation; the Joint Military Force of Armenia and Russia.

Ramila Bahlul Dadashova's article titled *The Factors Which Give Ground for the United Nations Security Council to Determine Armenia as an Aggressor State* argues that Armenia has fulfilled the necessary factors for it to be designated as an "aggressor state" by the United Nations Security Council, but that despite this, it has to this day not been designated as such.

Oleg Yuriyevich Kuznetsov in his article titled *The Ethno-Religious Origins of International Terrorism Perpetrated by Armenian Nationalists (Historical-Cultural Analysis)* seeks to understand the theoretical and cognitive aspects of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. For this endeavor, Kuznetsov examines the identitybased and motivational factors that induced Armenian nationalist formations to *carry out aggression against Azerbaijan in the events that constitute the Nagorno-*Karabakh conflict.

The article titled An Analysis of the Montebello Statement of the Armenian Revolutionary Federation in Light of the Territorial Claims of the Armenian Diaspora on Turkey by Ömer Lütfi Taşcıoğlu aims to systematically examine the content of and the arguments put forth in the Montebello Statement prepared by the Armenian Revolutionary Federation.

The first book review by Hazel Çağan Elbir examines *Legislating Reality And Politicizing History: Contextualizing Armenian Claims Of Genocide* authored by Brendon J. Cannon. Elbir emphasizes that the aim of the book is to relay to the reader how the Armenian campaign to have the 1915 events recognized as genocide changed throughout time and the content of the accusations leveled against Turkey in regard to this campaign.



The second book review, prepared by Sean Patrick Smyth, evaluates Talin Suciyan's book titled *The Armenians in Modern Turkey: Post-Genocide Society, Politics and History.* Smyth's review, while also mentioning the positive aspects of the work, emphasizes some glaring deficiencies that must be taken into consideration.

#### Review of Armenian Studies, Issue 36

The 36<sup>th</sup> issue of the *Review of Armenian Studies* contains five articles and one book review.

The first article of the 36<sup>th</sup> issue is *Facts and Comments*, which was penned by Ömer Engin Lütem. This article considers Turkish-Armenian relations and the developments regarding the 1915 events in the second half of 2017. Noteworthy developments in this period covered by the article include: the speeches delivered by President of Armenia Serzh Sargsyan during the 6<sup>th</sup> Pan-Armenian Armenia-Diaspora Conference and the UN General Assembly session, Armenia's initiation of a search for a new strategy for the recognition of its allegations regarding the 1915 events, Armenian Catholicosate of Cilicia's (located in Lebanon/Antelias) demand from Turkey to receive a piece of real estate that it had abandoned and its subsequent application to the European Court of Human Rights regarding this issue, and Germany's (which pursues a state policy in support of the Armenian genocide allegations) negotiation process with the Namibian government concerning the Herero and Nama genocide allegations.

The article titled 1915 Events, New Issues, and Reconciliation within the Framework of Persistence of Conflict and the Concept of Intractable Conflict prepared by Ebru Çoban Öztürk addresses the Turkish-Armenian controversy continuing for more than a century now in the framework of the concept of "intractable conflicts," which points to a special category of conflict. In this respect, the author emphasizes the need for the analysis of the socio-psychological basis of the Turkish-Armenian controversy.

In the article titled *The Foundation of the Armenian Revolutionary Federation and Its Activities in the Ottoman Empire in View of Russian Archival Sources (1890-1915)*, Olga Bykova, using Russian archival sources as a starting point, examines how the Armenian Revolutionary Federation-Dashnaktsutyun (ARF-Dashnaktsutyun) began to develop itself after its foundation and how it came to differ from other Armenian organizations. Bykova states that a serious internal security problem emerged due to ARF-Dashnaktsutyun's adventurist activities



and that the people to suffer most damage from these activities were the Armenians, meaning ARF-Dashnaktsutyun's own kinsmen.

Maxime Gauin in his article titled *Stopping the Censors: The Final Defeat of Armenian Nationalism at the French Constitutional Council in January 2017* explains the efforts of the Armenian diaspora in France to have the rejection of their genocide allegations outlawed, and how these efforts were affected by the decision of the Constitutional Council. According to Gauin, the decision taken by the Council on January 2017 has legally put an end to the diaspora's efforts that been sustained for the last twenty three years. This new situation has, according to Gauin, created a new and positive environment for the discussion 1915 events.

In his article titled *Research on the Issue of Christian, Hidden and/or Islamized Armenians in Turkey*, Ömer Lütfi Taşcıoğlu examines the general condition of the Armenian-origin Turkish citizens and their activities regarding the Turkish-Armenian controversy. The article touches upon the historical roots of the difference between Christian and hidden and/or Islamized Armenians. The article also gives space to the views of various authors about how hidden and/or Islamized Armenians should be defined and what their estimated numbers are.



In the 1970s and 1980s, a high number of Turkish diplomats, personnel, and their family members lost their lives as a result of the attacks carried out by Armenian terrorist organizations such as ASALA and the Justice Commandos, which all used the genocide allegations as a pretext for their attacks. These terrorist attacks have left deep scars in Turkish society. The extremeness of these attacks against Turkish targets have had effects beyond Turkish society, as well. For example, David Minier, the American prosecutor who took part in the trial of Gourgen Yanikian, who murdered the Turkish Consul General of Los Angeles Mehmet Baydar and Consul Bahadır Demir in 1973, wrote a novel inspired by the activities of Armenian terrorist organizations. Christopher Gunn evaluates Minier's above-mentioned book titled *The Ararat Illusion*, and indicates some inferences can be drawn from such works regarding the Cold War and the terrorist organizations that were active during this period.







#### ULUSLARARASI SUÇLAR VE TARİH / INTERNATIONAL CRIMES AND HISTORY

**U**<sup>luslararasi</sup> Suçlar ve Tarih / International Crimes and History (UST / ICH) is an annual peer-reviewed bilingual (Turkish and English) academic journal. First published in 2006, the UST / ICH is dedicated to be a platform for the scholarly investigation of inter-communal, inter-ethnic, inter-religious and international conflicts and crimes in the Balkans, the Caucasus, the Eurasia Region, and the Middle East. The editor of the journal is AVİM Honorary President Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem, while the managing editor is AVİM Senior Analyst Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel. The UST / ICH is indexed in the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey-Turkish Academic Network and Information Center (TUBİTAK-ULAKBİM) and EBSCO.

#### Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih / International Crimes and History, Issue 17

The 17<sup>th</sup> issue of the UST / ICH published in April 2017 is dedicated to the Balkans region, which was and still is dominated by complex political and social dynamics producing some of the most complicated divisions and conflicts in the world.

The article titled *Panslavizmin Çarlık Rusyası'nın ve Sovyetler Birliği'nin Balkan Politikaları Uzerindeki Etkisi* (The Influence of Panslavism in Tsarist Russia's and Soviet Union's Balkan Policies) written by Ali Asker and Merve Özel Özcan analyzes Panslavism which is one of the most important currents in the Russian history of thought. This study, which addresses the historical development, transformation, impact and results of Panslavism, provides the readers with a historical analysis about the place and function of Panslavism in the Russian foreign policy on the Balkans and contemporary Russian nationalism.

Cengiz Haksöz's article titled *The Making of the Rhodopean Borders and Construction of the Pomak Identities in the Balkans* analyzes the identity formation of the Pomaks, a Slavic-speaking Muslim community, within its relationality with Bulgarian, Greek and Turkish nation building processes. Within this framework, Haksöz elaborates on the formation of borders in the Rhodopes and how formation of borders affected the making of the identities of Pomaks in Bulgaria, Greece and Turkey.



İbrahim Fevzi Güven, in his article titled Yugoslavya'nın Dağılması Bağlamında Josip Broz Tito ve Slobodan Milosevic'in Söylem ve Politikalarının İncelenmesi (Examination of the Discourses and the Politics of Josip Broz Tito and Slobodan Milosevic in the Context of the Dissolution of Yugoslavia), comparing the attitude and policies of two Yugoslavian leaders Tito and Milosevic, examines the dissolution of Yugoslavia and analyzes how the different ideologies and policies of the two leaders influenced the fate of Yugoslavia.

Abdullah Tunç and Hamdi Fırat Büyük, in their study titled *Kosova ve Kırım Vakalarının Uluslararası Hukuk Perspektifinden Karşılaştırmalı Bir Analizi* (A Comparative Analysis of Kosovo and Crimea Cases from an International Law Perspective), address the Kosovo intervention and the annexation of Crimea with reference to international law, and their historical, demographical and political aspects, and analyze similarities and differences of the two events. Ultimately, Tunc and Buyuk reveal the basic differences between two cases, and demonstrate that the Kosovo case cannot be a precedent for the annexation of Crimea.

In addition to this studies that focus on the Balkans, the present issue of International Crimes and History also includes Teoman Ertuğrul Tulun's study titled *The Fabricated Pontus Narrative and Hate Speech*, which addresses the "Pontian Genocide" narrative that has been voiced since the end of the 1980s. This study, which is based on a comparative analysis of Greek and Turkish sources, points to hate speech that is integral to the "Pontian Genocide" narrative.



Lastly, Şükrü Elekdağ's report titled 81. Yılında Montrö Sözleşmesi'nin Karşılaştığı Güvenlik Sorunları ve Sözleşmenin Feshi ve Tadili İçin Girişimler Vukuunda Karşılaşılacak Senaryoların Analizi (Security Issues Faced by the Montreux Convention and the Analysis of Possible Scenarios in The Event of Attempts for the Annulment and Amendment of the Convention) analyzes current security issues faced by the Montreux Convention and possibilities that Turkey may encounter in the event of the cancelation or amendment of the Montreux Convention in recent times of striking geopolitical developments in the Black Sea basin.







#### AVRASYA DÜNYASI

In October 2017 AVİM published the first issue of its new bilingual (Turkish and English) journal titled *Avrasya Dünyası* (Eurasian World). The journal's focus is on the geographic region of Eurasia. Avrasya Dünyası, seeks to provide analyses, commentaries, and interviews that would shed light on the developments in the Balkans, Greater Black Sea Region, the Caucasus, and Central Asia and in the surrounding geography of these regions.

#### Avrasya Dünyası, Issue 1

Prof. Hikmet Özdemir in his article titled *Atatürk ve Asya* (Atatürk and Asia) discusses the relations of the early Republic of Turkey with with Asian countries

Dr. Roger Kangas, his article titled US Policy in Central Asia: Will Change Occur During the Trump Administration? examines the Trump government's perspective and policies towards Central Asia.

Dr. Farhad Mammadov in his article titled *Azerbaijan's Geopolitical Identity in the Context of the 21st Century Challenges and Prospects* refers to the role of Azerbaijan in the changing global system and regional development, and the foreign policy of Azerbaijan.

The article by Richard Giragosian titled *Turkey and the South Caucasus: The Imperative for Re-Engagement* examines the developments in the South Caucasus in the framework of Turkey-Armenia relations.

Dr. Göktuğ Sönmez in his article titled *Failed Nabucco Project and Its Implications* examines the causes of the failure of the Nabucco project and discusses such projects as TANAP-Turkish Current in the article titled Failed Nabucco Project and Its Implications.

The article by Dr. Farkhod Aminjonov titled *The Future of the Central Asian Energy Security* discusses the issue of energy security in Central Asia and presents the current situation and suggestions.

H.E. Hekmat Khalil Karzai in his article titled *Afghanistan and the Political and Security Landscape in the Region* refers to the developments in Afghanistan and the region, Turkey and Afghanistan relations.



The article titled *Iran's Science Diplomacy in the South Caucasus Case Study: The Republic of Azerbaijan* written by Prof. Elaheh Koolaee and Shiva Alizade reflects on the new concept of "science diplomacy" and how it could be applied in the example of Azerbaijan and Iran.

Assoc. Prof. Mehmet Arslan focuses on the historical background of the issues that lie in the demographic problems of Russia and the border between Russia and China and on the population issues in the article titled *Rusya'da Nüfusun Coğrafi Dağılımından Kaynaklanan Sorunlar ve Çin Tehlikesi*' (Problems of Geographical Distribution of Population in Russia and China Danger).

Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel mentions the short history of relations between Belarus and Russia, the present situation and the regional effects of bilateral relations in the article titled *Minsk-Moskova İlişkileri ve Rusya'nın Post-Soviet Yeniden Entegrasyon Politikasının Sorunları* (Minsk-Moscow Associations and Russia's Post-Soviet Reintegration Policy Problems).

Sabir Askeroğlu in his article titled *Rusya-Çin Stratejik Ortaklığının Küresel Boyutu* (The Global Dimension of Strategic Partnership between Russia and China) presents the global perspective of improving the strategic partnership between Russia and China including the dimension of its relations with the USA.

Ambassador (R) Koray Targay's article titled 21'inci Yüzyılın En Kapsamlı Altyapı Hamlesi: Modern İpek Yolu Girişimi (21<sup>st</sup> Century's Most Comprehensive Infrastructure Moves: Modern Silk Road Initiative) discusses the Economic Belt which launched in 2013 by China.

The article by Salih Işık Bora titled *The New Silk Road Initiative: Turkey's Stakes in the Global Developmental Project* explains Turkey's role in the Silk Road Economic Belt.



Prof. İsmail Aydıngün in his article titled *Yeni İpek Yolu Projesinin SSCB Sonrası Orta Asya'sında Ulus Devlet İnşa Sürecine Etkileri* (The Effects of the New Silk Road Project on the Nation-Building Process of Post-Soviet Central Asia) focuses on the diverse effects of the Silk Road Economic Belt Project by taking its effects on the nation-building processes in post-soviet Central Asia Area.

In the Analysis Section, R. Major General Ali Erdinç's article titled *Çin'in Tehdit Algısı, Güvenlik Stratejisi ve Avrasya* (China's Perception of Threat, Strategy of Security and Eurasia) analyzes China's Military Strategy and the perspective of China's Security Perception with the brief mention of the Recent History of China.



## **Reports**

AVIM AVRASYA INCELEMELERI MERKEZI Rapor • No: 11 • Nisan 2017

## Tarihsel Arka Planiyla PONTUS MESELESI

Ropor

Yrd. Doç. Dr. Yüksel KÜÇÜKER Prof. Dr. Hikmet ÖKSÜZ





Tarihsel Arka Planıyla Pontus Meselesi (Pontus Issue with its Historical Background)

Authors: Assist. Prof. Yüksel KÜÇÜKER and Prof. Hikmet ÖKSÜZ

(Turkish, paperback, 88 pages)

The Pontus issue, which evolved from the goal of establishing an independent state on the Black Sea into a political and cultural matter with the passage of time is often discussed in context of the events of the Turkish War of Independence. Evaluating the issue only in the aforementioned regard means that it will be viewed as an ordinary rebellion. However, upon closer examination, it emerged that the issue has a historical base situated on an intellectual basis which extends to an earlier age than previously assumed. Examining the difficulties of the Ottoman state since the 19<sup>th</sup> century makes it easier to understand the main premises of the Pontus issue. When this process is evaluated as a whole, the depth of the Pontus question becomes more evident. Despite this issue being considered by most in Turkey as a memory consigned to the dusty pages of history, Greece takes every opportunity to opine on the Pontus genocide issue that is raised by Greece and the Greek diaspora at regular intervals and which designed to put Turkey in a difficult political situation.

The designation of the date 19 May, 1919 – recognized by Turks as the beginning of the Turkish War of Independence – as a day of remembrance for what they term the Pontus genocide by the decision of the Greek parliament is the most radical step taken in this direction. Turkey's position paints a passive image on the Pontus question despite Greece's provocative attitude. Encouraging further research by historians on the Pontus question will constitute the first step of abandoning that passive attitude. This study, which was prepared with a historical approach, was undertaken in this context in order to make a modest contribution to the literature on the subject.







81. Yılında Montrö Sözleşmesi'nin Karşılaştığı Güvenlik Sorunları ve Sözleşmenin Feshi ve Tadili İçin Girişimler Vukuunda Karşılaşılacak Senaryoların Analizi (Analysis of the Security Problems of the Montreux Convention and the Scenarios of the Possible Attempts of Rescission or Modification)

Author: Dr. Şükrü M. Elekdağ

(Turkish, paperback, 20 pages)

On the 81<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the signing of the Montreux Convention, It appears that geopolitical changes have occurred in the Black Sea region, the regions strategic importance has increased, and a renewed Cold War atmosphere has been emerging in the region. Because of Russia's efforts to establish hegemony in the Black Sea region with the annexation of the Crimea and the support granted to separatist Russian-origin rebels in the Donbass Region of Ukraine, tensions between Russia and the West are rising. At Warsaw Summit on 8-9 July 2016, it was decided to take a series of military measures on defending East and North Europe from Russian expansionism.

In this context, decisions have been taken to increase NATO's military presence in the Black Sea, and the establishment of a permanent presence of NATO under the name of "NATO Standing Maritime Force" has come to the fore. It can further be observed that Russia's actions are of an increasingly aggressive character after the resolutions at the Warsaw Summit

There is a perception in the western press that this situation forces the legal status of the Turkish straits. It is seen that the problems which was closed with signing of the Straits Convention in Montreux in 1936 have begun to surface again.

The report titled *Analyses of the Security Problems of the Montreux Convention and Scenario Analyses on Possible Attempts of Rescission or Modification* includes current security problems and scenarios that Turkey will be faced with in the situation of rescission or modification of article 28 and 29 of the Montreux Convention.







Türkiye Cumhuriyeti/Osmanlı Devleti ve Ardıllık/Devamlılık Sorunsalının Görelileşmesi (Republic of Turkey/Ottoman Empire and Relativization of the Problematic of Succession/Continuity)

Author: Dr. Deniz Akçay

(Turkish, Paperback, 52 pages)

In light of result research on the Armenian question increasingly employing the terminology of law, AVIM decided to concentrate efforts on comprehensive studies in the field of law. In this context, law workshops that we have conducted with the cooperation of various universities and with the relevant specialists and academics have begun to work on the Armenian issue in a legal perspective. Perhaps, the most important result of these efforts are the improvements in the quality of studies that have been prepared by specialists and academics alike. As the product of these studies, AVIM started to publish the proceedings of the law workshops. The report titled "Uluslararası Hukukta Zarar Giderimi ve Ermeni Talepleri" (Compensations in International Law and Armenian Demands) prepared by Ertan Kiraz was published by AVIM in December 2016.

The report prepared by Dr. Deniz Akçay titled "Türkiye Cumhuriyeti/Osmanlı Devleti ve Ardıllık/Devamlılık Sorunsalının Görelileşmesi" (Republic of Turkey/Ottoman Empire and relativization of Succession/Continuity Problem) is the second of these.

Theses about if the Republic of Turkey is the successor of the Ottoman Empire or not is a pertinent topic in the various debates related to the Armenian question at the present time. Dr. Akçay, in her study, offers a detailed review of the arguments of these various theses that posit that Turkey is the successor of the Ottoman Empire. Dr. Akçay argued that some of the articles of Lausanne Treaty have been misinterpreted. Dr. Akçay's work provides an important scholarly contribution to the debates of the succession/continuity relationship between Ottoman Empire and the Republic of Turkey.







#### The Pontus Narrative and Hate Speech

#### Author: Teoman Ertuğrul TULUN

(English, paperback, 32 pages)

T he Pontus Narrative and Hate Speech examines the Pontus Greek narrative regarding the developments of the First World War the baseless character of the assertions put forward especially by the Greek diaspora in relation to the fabricated claims of what they term the Pontus genocide. Since these claims are directed not only against the Ottoman Empire, but also to the provisional Turkish Government based in Ankara during the Turkish War of Independence which established the Republic of Turkey, the report in a evaluates the evolution of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk's views concerning the Pontus question as contained in his historical speech delivered in 1927 known as *Nutuk*. The report also dwells on the hate speech developed over the years against Turks and the Republic of Turkey based on genocide claims.

The report reflects AVİM's efforts to bring a fair, objective and academic perspective to the one-sided and distorted narratives against Turks and The Republic of Turkey on this issue.







#### Belgelerin Işığında Pontus Meselesi (Pontus Question in the Light of Documents)

Author: Prof. Mesut Çapa

(Turkish, paperback, 72 pages)

As a result of changes in the geopolitical structure, Turkey's central position in Eurasia is becoming increasingly evident. Due to the increasing geopolitical importance of the region and the coming of the fore of new issues, AVİM has commissioned a series of academic works on the Pontus question. In this context, the report titled *Pontus Question In the Light of Documents* by Assoc. Prof. Yüksel Küçüker and Prof. Hikmet Öksüz and the report titled *The Pontus Narrative and Hate Speech* prepared in English by Teoman Ertuğrul Tulun who is analyst at AVİM was published.

In addition, Dr. Mesut Çapa's research article entitled *Pontus Question In the Light of Documents* who has been working extensively on the Pontus question for many years was published by AVİM as a report. We hope that this work, which also includes new archival documents, will make an important contribution to the academic work being conducted on this topic.







Osmanlı Devleti'ndeki Hukuki Düzenlemeler Çerçevesinde Ermeniler ve Geride Bıraktıkları Mallar (Emvâl-i Metruke)

(Armenians and Their Assets Left Behind in the Framework of Legal Arrangements in the Ottoman Empire (Emvâl-i Metruke))

Author: Prof. Gül AKYILMAZ

(Turkish, paperback, 96 pages)

The third pillar of the hostile campaign against Turkey by Armenia and Armenian diaspora relates to the legal claims in addition to the historical and political base.

Most recently Turkey has won important goals especially on the legal ground against the genocide allegations. To build upon these achievements and with the superiority of the principle of the rule of law in mind, AVİM organized series of legal workshops with the participation of academics and legal specialists.

In October 2015, the Armenian demands and claims were examined from the legal point of view in the workshop titled 1915 Olayları ve Hukuk" (The 1915 Events and Law) hosted by Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Başkent University, Dokuz Eylül University, Özyeğin University and Inönü University respectively.

On the other hand, the issue of abandoned property known as the *Emval-i Metruke* has recently gained importance in the debates surrounding the topic.

At these meetings, a more detailed and analytical work was presented in order to clarify the unlawful rhetoric and claims that had been brought to the agenda about the issue of abandoned property.

This report written by Prof. Gül Akyılmaz constitutes a step forward for filling the gap in literature. We hope that this valuable report, presenting in detail to the reader in the context of law, will be welcomed by relevant researchers, legal specialists and historians, and pave the way for further researches on the subject.

AVİM 2017 Annual Report

# AVİM Trainee Program



## **AVİM Trainee Program**

**A** VİM carries out trainee programs throughout the year. For its Trainee Programs, AVİM accepts application from undergraduate and graduate students and recent graduates who are highly proficient in at least one foreign language, and who wish to carry out comprehensive studies on the recent political developments in Europe, the Balkans, Wider Black Sea Region, the Caucasus, and Central Asia that have strategic importance for Turkey. AVİM offers two separate trainee programs, one short term and one long-term.

AVİM Trainee Program participants (TPP) are expected to help in the organization of AVİM activities and events, and to contribute to the work that goes



Tutku Dilaver, YBÜ Caucasus Studies Masters Program, AVİM TPP Merve Çaldıran, TOBB ETÜ Department of Political Science, AVİM TPP Özge Nur Öğütcü, AVİM Analyst Göksu Çana, TOBB ETÜ Department of Political Science, AVİM TPP Can Berk Kanat, ODTÜ Department of Political Science and Public Adm., AVİM TPP



## **AVIM Trainee Program**

into the preparation of AVİM's publications. Additionally, the program participants are requested to follow the developments in the Eurasia region throughout their term.

AVİM Trainee Program participants are required to prepare a report at the end of their program. This report should be based on the detailed research that AVİM Trainee Program participants should carry out throughout the course of their program about a topic of interest. In this way, AVİM Trainee Program participants are expected to gain the opportunity to carry out detailed research in a professional environment, benefiting also from the knowledge and expertise of AVİM analysts.

Regarding information on AVİM Trainee Program, candidates may contact Vuslat Nur Şahin via *staj@avim.org.tr* or *vsahin@avim.org.tr*.



Hasan İlkbahar, YBÜ Department of International Relations, AVİM TPP





OBB Economy and Technology University provided me with the opportunity to acquire **1** OBB Economy and Technology Oniversity provided in the internal of the three and a half month compulsory Joint Training Program. AVIM provided me with the opportunity to acquire personal experiences in addition academic developments thanks to the facilities provided by the working environment and relevant resident specialists. From an academic point of view, I noticed through AVIM that I had acquired very little academic knowledge on the Eurasian region during my undergraduate years and I had to work to develop my interests on this point. Apart from this, providing an opportunity to research the area and the specific subjects that we are interested in the Eurasian region and having the opportunity to formulate this as a project is another factor that benefited me academically. During the weekly meetings organized by AVIM, we were able to observe internal working conditions with the participation of interns in the meetings, which is a great contribution to our professional experience. I think that by getting the opportunity to participate in the conferences organized by AVIM, both in terms of acquiring knowledge and learning how to organize conferences, was also highly beneficial. The interactions I had with people I met at meetings and conferences was another horizon expanding personal experience for me. Providing disciplined work as well as sincerity of the working environment and giving employees the opportunity to continuously improve themselves is a place where I will endeavor to work in the future. I would like to express my gratitude to AVIM and its staff for providing me with these wonderful experiences during the course of my internship.

AVİM 2017 Annual Report

## Other Activities



### 1915 Events and Law Workshops

The divergent Turkish and Armenian interpretations, memories and assessments regarding the 1915 events is one of the primary reasons for the politicization of the controversy, leading to debates on the issue to lack the necessary scientific and academic character. In these debates that take place in an incredibly politicized environment, the very important legal aspect of the issue has not been sufficiently addressed.

Existing legal studies mostly focus on criminal law and revolve around question of individual penal responsibility. However, today, legal debates on the 1915 events go beyond criminal law aspect and focus on 'state responsibility' and the matter of human rights. Furthermore, the Armenian side seeks to move the issue into the legal sphere with demands such as reparations.

Based on this observation, AVİM set out to organize a series of workshops on the theme of 1915 Events and International Law. The first being held on 8-9 October 2015 in collaboration with Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University with the title *Legal Aspects of the 1915 Events*, the workshop series continued in 2016 with subsequent workshops organized in cooperation with Başkent University titled the *Perincek Precedent and Its Effects*), Dokuz Eylül University titled *Property Law*), Özyeğin University titled *Successor State-Continuing State*.

In 2017, AVİM organized the fifth of the 1915 Events and Law workshops at İnönü University with the title Possible Initiatives and Counter Measures.



## **Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views Conference Series**

In today's environment where the geopolitical center of gravity is shifting from the Euro-Atlantic region to the Asia-Pasific, AVİM, seeking to contribute to the understanding of challenges and opportunities that Turkey faces within the changing global geopolitical context, attributes particular attention to two key components of Eurasia in its studies – the Balkans and the Caucasus. Within this framework, AVİM continues its studies on Turkish-Armenian relations, an issue of particular concern for Turkey in the Wider Black Sea region.

In 2016, as part of its focus on the Turkish-Armenian relations, AVİM organized a series of conferences under the title of *Armenian Question 2016: 10 Views* with the participation of Turkish and foreign academics who have conducted research on the Armenian question, and Turkish diplomats who took part in the implementation of Turkey's foreign policy on this issue.

In 2017, AVİM continued the series with the title *Armenian Question 2017: 12 Views*. Within this series a total of twelve academics gave conferences at AVİM focusing on different aspects of the Turkish-Armenian dispute on the characteristics of the 1915 events and the effects of this dispute on the present day politics.



## **Cooperation Agreement between AVİM and Korea Institute of National Unification**



In November 2017, a cooperation agreement between AVİM and the Korea Institute of National Unification was signed. The agreement foresees the organization of joint research projects, the exchange of information and analyses and organization of conferences, seminars and round table discussions.

## Hazel Çağan Elbir's Book Published by Manzara Verlag

VİM Analyst Hazel Çağan Elbir's Silent Sorrows: Armenian Terrorism and the Turkish Press (1973-1984) was published by the Frankfurt-based publishing house Manzara Verlag. An edited version of the author's master's thesis, the preface of which was authored by Jeremy Salt, this work examines the terrorist campaign waged against Turkish diplomats by ASALA and the Justice Commandos of the Armenian Genocide. This work primarily focuses on how the Turkish press evaluated the terrorist campaign which waged between the years 1973-1984.



AVIM 2017 Annual Report








Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem, Honorary President Ambassador (R) Alev Kılıç, Director Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan, Advisor Aslan Yavuz Şir, Senior Analyst Dr. Turgut Kerem Tuncel, Senior Analyst Hazel Çağan Elbir, Analyst Özge Nur Öğütcü, Analyst Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun, Analyst **Teoman Ertuğrul Tulun,** Analyst Ali Murat Taşkent, Analyst Tutku Dilaver, Scholar in Residence Maxime Gauin, Scholar in Residence Sean Patrick Symth, Scholar in Residence Vuslat Nur Şahin, Scholar in Residence Ahmet Can Öktem, Translator Hülya Önalp, Assistant of the Director of AVİM Ali Kenan Erbulan, Administrative Staff



## Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin LÜTEM, Honorary President





A mbassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem graduated from the Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Ankara in 1957 and became career diplomat in the same year. During his service at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ambassador (R) Lütem had served as the Turkish Consul General at Cologne, Germany (1975-1979), Director General of Personnel of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) of the Republic of Turkey (1979-1981), Director General of Intelligence and Research of the MFA of the Republic of Turkey (1981-1983), Ambassador of the Republic of Turkey to Bulgaria (1983-1989), Deputy Undersecretary of the MFA (1989-1992), Ambassador of the Republic of Turkey to the Vatican (1992-1995) and the Permanent Representative of the Republic of Turkey to UNESCO (1995-1997).

After his retirement in 1998, he served as the Director of the Institute for Armenian Research at Eurasian Strategic Research Center (2000-2008) and Director of the Center for Eurasian Studies (2009-2012).

Ambassador (R) Ömer Engin Lütem is the editor of the journals *Ermeni Araştırmaları* (Armenian Studies; published since 2001), Review of Armenian Studies (published since 2002), and International Crimes and History / Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih (bilingual in Turkish and English; published since in 2006).

#### His works include:

- Türkiye-Bulgaristan İlişkileri, 1983-1989 vol. 1 (Turkish-Bulgarian Relations, 1983-1989 vol. 1), ASAM, Ankara, 2000.
- Balkan Diplomasisi (Balkan Diplomacy), ASAM, Ankara 2001
- Ermeni Sorunu El Kitabı (Handbook of the Armenian Question), ASAM-TEİMK, Ankara, 2003
- Türkiye-Bulgaristan İlişkileri, 1983-1989 vol. 2 (Turkish-Bulgarian Relations, 1983-1989 vol. 2), ASAM, Ankara, 2005.
- Armenian Terror, ASAM, Ankara, 2007.
- Armenian Question: Basic Knowledge and Documentation, AVIM, Ankara, 2009.



## Ambassador (R) Alev KILIÇ, Director





Ankara University in 1968. The next year, he joined the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) of the Republic of Turkey. During his service at the MFA, Ambassador (R) Kılıç served in Jordan (1972-1974) and Munich-Germany (1974-1977), at the Ministry in Ankara (1977-1979), in Germany at the Embassy in Bonn (1979-1983), at the Ministry in Ankara (1983-1985), in Bulgaria at the Turkish Embassy in Sofia as the First Councellor (1985-1991), back in Ankara as the Deputy Director General for Central Asian, Caucauses and Slavic countries (1991-1996).

Ambassador (R) Kılıç served as the Ambassador to the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia between 1996 and 1998 and Ambassador/Permanent Representative to the Council of Europe in Strasbourg between 1998 and 2001. In 2001-2004, he served as the Deputy Undersecretary of the MFA for Economic Affairs. Ambassador (R) Kılıç again served as the Ambassador to Switzerland (2004-2009) and Ambassador to Mexican United States (2009-2011).

Ambassador (R) Kılıç retired from the MFA in 2011.

He has been the Director of AVİM since 2013.

Contact info: akilic@avim.org.tr



## Ambassador (R) Yiğit ALPOGAN, AVIM Advisor





A mbassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan graduated from the Faculty of Political Science of Ankara University in 1967. In 1968, he joined the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey, where he served in different positions ranging from Head of Section to Deputy Undersecretary, and abroad in Turkish missions in several countries. Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan was appointed First Secretary of the Turkish Embassy in Tokyo (1972-1975) and in Nicosia (1975-1977), Counsellor of the Permanent Delegation of Turkey to the UN Office in Geneva (1979-1983), First Counsellor of the Turkish Embassy in The Hague (1985-1989), and Minister-Counsellor of the Turkish Embassy in Athens (1991-1995).

Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan became ambassador in 1995 and has since served in this position in several embassies such as Ashgabat (1995-1998) and Athens (2001-2004), before his appointment as the first civilian Secretary General of the National Security Council of Turkey (2004-2007). Ambassador (R) Yiğit Alpogan was then appointed Ambassador to London, where he served from 2007 to 2010. Following his retirement from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 2010, he joined the Secretariat of the Union for the Mediterranean (UfM) in Barcelona and served as Deputy Secretary General until the completion of his term in 2016.

Ambasador (R) Yiğit Alpogan joined AVİM in December 2016 in an advisory capacity.

#### Contact info:

yalpogan@avim.org.tr



## Aslan Yavuz ŞİR, Senior Analyst



Aslan Yavuz Şir graduated from Bilkent University Department of Political Science in 2004. He earned his MA from Middle East Technical University Department of Eurasian Studies and MS from Department of European Studies in 2007. He's currently a PhD candidate at the Department of International Relations, Middle East Technical University.

Şir previously worked as an analyst at Global Strategy Institute and Center for Middle Eastern Strategic Studies (ORSAM) respectively between 2006 and 2009. He's working as Senior Analyst at the Center for Eurasian Studies since 2009. His research interests are Post-Soviet studies, Central Asia, the Black Sea and the South Caucasus, conflict resolution studies and Turkish Armenian relations.

His articles appeared in *Review of Armenian Studies, Global Strategy Journal, Harvard Central Eurasian Studies Review, Ortadoğu Analiz, Eurasia Critic* and *Daily Sabah.* 

#### Contact info:

ayavuzsir@avim.org.tr https://tr.linkedin.com/in/aslan-yavuz-sir-6b239454

https://metu.academia.edu/AslanYavuzSir



## Dr. Turgut Kerem TUNCEL, Kıdemli Analist

**D**r. Turgut Kerem Tuncel completed his undergraduate degree in 2001 at Middle East Techical University with a major in Psychology and a minor in Sociology. He holds a Master's degree in Political Science from Bilkent University. In 2014, Turgut earned his PhD degree in Sociology and Social Research from Università degli Studi di Trento. During his doctoral studies, he had been a pre-doc visiting scholar at Michigan University, Ann Arbor Armenian Studies Program.

Dr. Tuncel worked as research/teaching assistant between 2001 and 2009 at Bilkent University and İstanbul Bilgi University. He joined AVİM in January 2015. Dr. Tuncel is the author of the book Armenian Diaspora: Diaspora, State and the Imagination of the Republic of Armenia (Ankara, Terazi, 2014). He published articles in Review of Armenian Studies and Uluslararasi Suçlar ve Tarih / International Crimes and History journals. He contributes to Turkish and foreign media with his commentaries on current political affairs in the Eurasian region, the Wider Black Sea Region and the Caucasus.

## CENTER FOR EURASI



#### **Contact info:**

tuncel@avim.org.tr

https://tr.linkedin.com/in/turgut-tuncel-54a3539b

https://unitn.academia.edu/turgutturgut



## Hazel ÇAĞAN ELBİR, Analyst



azel Çağan Elbir graduated from Political Science and Public Administration, Bilkent University in 2008 and holds MSc. in International Relations from Middle East Technical University (2012).

Having completed Master's thesis on Armenian Terrorism and the Turkish Press (1973-1984), Çağan Elbir interned in TGNA (2006), Center for Eurasian Strategic Studies (ASAM) (2007), Institute for Global Strategy (2007) and attended a Project on Model European Parliament in Graz, Austria. Çağan worked in Institute for Global Strategy for four months in 2008 as a specialist on the Balkans. During her Master's degree, interned in Center for Eurasian Studies (2011) and as of 2012 Çağan Elbir joined AVİM as an analyst in February 2012. She is currently a PhD. student in interdisciplinary department Political Economy from Atılım University.

Çağan Elbir's research areas are European Union, Turkey - US Relations, the Balkans, Caucasus, propaganda studies, crimes against humanity, terrorism.

Çağan Elbir also contributes in the AVİM Daily Bulletin, EU section.

#### Contact info:

hcagan@avim.org.tr https://tr.linkedin.com/in/hazelcagan https://metu.academia.edu/HazelCagan



## Özge Nur ÖĞÜTCÜ, Analyst

zge Nur Öğütcü graduated from Baskent University Department of Political Science and International Relations in 2009. She completed a double diploma program organized by Istanbul Bilgi University and Institut Européen des Hautes Études Internationales on Advanced European and International Studies. She received her Master degree in July in 2013. After completing her 6-month-internship, Ogutcu worked at NATO HQ, Public Diplomacy Division, as a temporary staff / consultant for 6 months between the dates 14 March 2011 - 29 March 2012. In addition to her various internship experiences, she participated in national and international events as an organization team member.

Özge Nur Öğütcü, who joined AVİM in October in 2013 left her post in December 2017.





## Mehmet Oğuzhan TULUN, Analyst



Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun completed his undergraduate degree in 2008 at McGill University Faculty of Arts, with a major in political science, minor in International Relations, and minor in History. In 2012 he completed his Master's degree at Başkent University European Union and International Relations Institute. He is currently pursuing his doctoral degree in Political Science at Ankara University.

Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun joined AVİM in October 2013.

His research focuses on the Balkans, Eastern Europe, Caucasus, international crimes and international history, and the interplay between religion and politics.

**Contact info:** motulun@avim.org.tr https://ankara.academia.edu/MehmetO%C4% 9FuzhanTulun



## Teoman Ertuğrul TULUN, Analyst

Teoman Ertuğrul Tulun has completed his undergraduate studies at McGill University in Political Science (Major), International Relations (Minor), and History (Minor) and graduated in 2003. Between 2003-2004, he worked as senior research assistant at the European Union Communication Group (ABIG).

He worked as a research assistant at Bilkent University International Relations Department between 2004-2006. He received his Master of Arts Degree from Bilkent University International Relations Department in 2009. He wrote his master's thesis on the Effects of Natural Resources on the State Building Process.

Since 2010, he is continuing his doctoral studies at Bilkent University Department of Political Science and Public Administration. Between 2010 and 2015, he worked as research assistant and teaching assistant at the same department. Between 2012-2015 at the same department, he taught Introduction to Sociology and Introduction to Political Science I courses.

Tulun joined AVİM in August 2016.

#### **Contact info:**

tetulun@avim.org.tr

https://www.linkedin.com/in/teoman-ertu%C4 %9Frul-tulun-57508a10b?trk=hp-identity-name

https://bilkent.academia.edu/TeomanTulun





## Ali Murat TAŞKENT, Analyst



A li Murat Taşkent graduated from the Department of Economics at Başkent University in 2007. Between 2008 and 2012, Taşkent worked in the private sector in the Russian Federation.

Ali Murat Taşkent started working at AVİM in April 2015 and left this position in August 2017.



## Tutku DİLAVER, Scholar in Residence

utku Dilaver graduated from the Department of International Relations of Ankara University's Faculty of Political Sciences in 2015. After her graduation, she took lectures on EU-Turkey Relations, EU Law, and EU History at Master's level in the European Union and International Economic Relations program of Ankara University's Avrupa Toplulukları Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi (ATAUM -Communities European Research and Implementation Center). In 2016, Dilaver began pursuing her Master's degree in the Caucasus Studies Program under the Department of International Relations at Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University's Institute of Social Sciences.

During her undergraduate studies, Tutku Dilaver participated in the Association Internationale des Étudiants en Sciences Économiques et Commerciales (AIESEC) student community as a volunteer. In 2016, she worked as the Project Assistant in a private company dealing with European Union projects. After her completion of a six-month trainee program in the Center for Eurasian Studies (AVIM) in August 2017, she joined AVIM as a Scholar in Residence.



**Contact info:** tdilaver@avim.org.tr



#### Maxime GAUIN, Scholar in Residence



Maxime Gauin has been AVİM's scholar in residence since August 2012. Gauin got his B.A. in History from *université Bordeaux-III* in 2005 and M.A. in Contemporary History from *université Paris-I-Sorbonne* and *École normale supérieure de Lyon* in 2010. He is currently pursuing a Ph.D. degree in History at the Middle East Technical University.

Previously, Gauin worked as a researcher at the International Strategic Research Organization (USAK). He has published articles in various academic journals including *the European Journal of International Law, the Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs, the International Review of Turkish Studies.* He also contributes to different dailies such as *Hürriyet Daily News, Daily Sabah, Haaretz, The Jerusalem Post,* and *Cumhuriyet.* 

Maxime Gauin's research focuses on contemporary aspects of the Armenian question and Franco-Turkish relations.

#### Contact info:

gauin.maxime@wanadoo.fr https://tr.linkedin.com/in/maxime-gauin-55329b94

https://metu.academia.edu/MaximeGauin



## Sean Patrick SYMTH, Scholar in Residence

Sean Patrick Smyth completed his undergraduate education at Bilkent University's Department of Political Science and Public Administration, graduating in 2014. In 2016, he earned his master's degree in the Turkish Studies track of Middle Eastern Studies at Leiden University in the Netherlands.

Sean Patrick Smyth joined AVİM in May 2017. His research at AVİM primarily focuses on the Armenian issue in both its historical and present forms. In addition his work at AVİM, Mr. Smyth is also engaged in research on late Ottoman intellectual history and the transnational formation of Turkish nationalism.



#### Contact info:

spsmyth@avim.org.tr



## Vuslat Nur ŞAHİN, Scholar in Residence

ENTER FOR EURASIA



uslat Nur Şahin completed her undergraduate degree in 2017 at Middle East Technical University's Faculty of Economics and Administrative Science, with a major in international relations and minor in corporate finance. She also severed as a student assistant while at METU. She was an intern at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs' Strategic Research Center in 2015, and the Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency in 2016. She carried out various duties as both academic and administrative student assistants at METU. Furthermore, she is an alumni of the German Academic Exchange Service.

Vuslat Nur Şahin joined AVİM in September 2017. She is currently pursuing a Master's degree in International Relations at METU.

Contact info: vsahin@avim.org.tr



## Ahmet Can ÖKTEM, Translator

hmet Can Öktem has completed his Aundergraduate studies at Eskişehir Osmangazi University, in the field of Economics at the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, graduating in 2013. Öktem has been accepted to the Masters degree programme at the Middle Eastern Technical University's European Integration field at the Faculty of Social Sciences in 2014. His studies are in progress. In 2016, he joined the diploma programme of CIFE, Centre international de formation europeenne, in Advanced European Studies and International Relations. He has taken an internship between September 2013 and December 2013 at the EU Ministry.

Öktem has been working at AVİM as a translator since October 2017.



**Contact info:** coktem@avim.org.tr



### Hülya ÖNALP, Assistant of the Director of AVIM



➡ Ülya Önalp graduated from the Department of Agricultural Economics at Ankara University in 1994. In the years 1996-2002, Önalp worked at YAYSAT Inc. as circulation planner and as the Chief of Planing for Ankara Region at Dergi Pazarlama Planlama Inc. from 2002-2004.

From 2005 to 2008, She worked at the *Center for Eurasian Strategic Studies* where she was the Sales Manager.

Hülya Önalp joined AVİM in 2009 as the Assistant to the Director.

#### Contact info:

honalp@avim.org.tr



## Ali Kenan ERBULAN, Administrative Staff

**E**rbulan obtained his undergraduate degree from the Department of Business Administration at Anadolu University.

Between 1999 and 2010, he worked in various firms responsible for management-sales-administrative issues.

Ali Kenan Erbulan joined AVİM in November 2010.

Contact info: aerbulan@avim.org.tr



AVİM 2017 Annual Report

# A Look Into 2018



## A LOOK INTO 2018

**O** ur outlook for the New Year, in essence, is the continuously gaining momentum of our forecast for 2017 stated in our 2016 report. The effects of the changes in the global balance of power that have been maintained for approximately four centuries unfortunately carries with it the potential for instability, upheavals and possibilities of adventures whose outcomes cannot be assessed in advance. The reflections of the new global balance shaping between the East and the West will certainly be felt more closely by Turkey which lies at the nexus of the Eurasian geography.

Turkey's traditional bonds and regional relations shall also be influenced by this general course of events. Turkey is conscious of the priority and importance of the maintenance and further strengthening of its alliance with the West and close relations with the European Union. On the other hand, the inability to say that Turkey is receiving a similar response or approach from this front is causing discomfort. The avoidance of reaction to the perception of such an attitude, namely Turkey being hitherto ignored and/or superficially treated is becoming increasingly untenable. It is becoming obvious that discrimination by religion, augmented by the increasing racism and xenophobia does not create a positive ground for relations. Discussions on how to respond to the EU's persistence to keep Turkey close but outside, which is overshadowing relations and creating uncertainty, is bound to intensify throughout the year.

It is fair to presume that the "America first" slogan that continues to be emphasized will create further hurdles to cooperation opportunities on equal footing on a global scale. To align the United State's approach towards the concept of Eurasia, taking into consideration Turkey's interests in the region will require substantial efforts. Turkey, which has both European and Asian traits by virtue of its location and identity, a sui generis quality, cannot stay non-committed to the developments in the Far East and the resurgence observed in Asia. The projects initiated by China, which comprise the Central Asian countries and extend as far as Turkey, will continue to raise interest regarding the enabling of Turkey to connect with a region it has multifaceted ties with.

Turkey, located at the junction of Europe and Asia and in the geography of the broad Black Sea region, is bound to play an efficient role in the global changes and developments. The year 2018 will be a year when clues may arise on the new role Turkey can assume. Turkey's connection with Asia is provided by two routes, through the Southern Caucasus and Iran. The powerful union created by the oil and



natural gas pipelines in the Southern Caucasus has opened the doors to a more active future with the Baku-Tbilisi-Kars railway becoming operational.

The absence of communication with Armenia, a state that is a factor for instability in the South Caucasus which also seeks willingly to be used to hinder Turkey's evolving new position in the region, can be predicted to continue without much change. AVİM will continue its realistic and constructive work, research and activities regarding this subject with resolve. Our series of conferences that have discussed the various aspects of the Armenian controversy in the years 2016 and 2017 and also printed as books will continue in the year 2018.

Among the planned and scheduled activities of AVİM for the coming year are the commemorations of the hundredth year anniversary of the year 1918 when the South Caucasian countries first gained their independence, even for a short period, and the commemoration of the 70th year of the United Nations' 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, to which Turkey was a co-sponsor. Furthermore, our aim is to strengthen relations with the diplomatic corps in Ankara and think tanks abroad, sharing the area of interest to AVİM.

AVİM Director Ambassador (R) **Alev KILIÇ** 

AVİM 2017 Annual Report

# AVIM Publications



# **AVİM Books**



Ermeni Konferansları 2016 Editor: Ömer Engin Lütem Publication Date: May 2017 Language: Türkçe ISBN: 978-605-82518-2-3 (Paperback, 168 pages)



Gürcistan'daki Müslüman Topluluklar: Azınlık Hakları, Kimlik, Siyaset Editors: Ayşegül Aydıngün, Ali Asker, Aslan Yavuz Şir Publication Date: June 2016 Language: Turkish ISBN: 97605601974 (Paperback, 428 pages)



Turkish-Russian Academics: A Historical Study on the Caucasus Editor: AVİM Publication Date: April 2016 Publisher: Terazi Yayınları Language: English ISBN: 9786056061967 (Paperback, 248 pages)



# **AVİM Books**

Armenian Diaspora:

**Republic of Armenia** 

Author: Turgut Kerem Tuncel





Second edition August 2015 Language: English ISBN: 9786056061950 (Paperback, 342 pages) Balkan Savaşlarında Rumeli Türkleri

Publication Date: First edition December 2014;

Diaspora, State and the Imagination of the

Kırımlar - Kıyımlar – Göçler (1821-1913) Author: Bilâl N. Şimşir Publication Date: September 2014 Language: Turkish ISBN: 978-605-60619-4-3 (Paperback, 312 pages)



'Aza Beast'
Savaşın Köklerine İnmek

Bir Bosna Savaşı Günlüğü 

Author: Colum Murphy

Translation: M. Sina Baydur

Publication Date: 2013

Language: Turkish
ISBN: 978-605-60619-3-6
(Paperback, 368 pages)



# **AVİM Books**



Ermeni Sorunu Temel Bilgi ve Belgeler Author: Ömer Engin Lütem Publication Date: 2009 Language: Turkish ISBN: ISBN 978-605-60619-1-2 (Paperback, 520 pages)



The Armenian Question Basic Knowledge and Documentation Author: Ömer Engin Lütem Publication Date: 2009 Language: English ISBN: ISBN 978-605-60619-0-5 (Paperback, 470 pages)



## **AVİM Conference Books**

- "11. Asya Avrupa Zirvesi Öncesi Moğolistan'daki Güncel Durum, Moğolistan'ın Bölgesel Potansiyeli ve Türk-Moğol İlişkileri". No: 19, Ankara April 2016.
- Projections for the Future of Turkish-Armenian Relations. No: 18, Ankara March 2016.
- Security and Stability Concerns in the South Caucasus. No: 17, Ankara July 2015.
- Policy of Mass Killings in the Early 20<sup>th</sup> Century in Colonial Africa: The Case of Genocide in Namibia and the Lessons Learned. No: 16, Ankara July 2015.
- Prospects for Turkish-Armenian Relations. No: 15, Ankara July 2015.
- Turkic Council and Cooperation in Eurasia in the Light of Developments Across the Region. No: 14, Ankara February 2015.
- 28 Ocak AİHM Perinçek-İsviçre Duruşmasının Işığında Türk-Ermeni Sorunu. No: 13, Ankara February 2015.
- The 'Sociological Turn' of Taiwan-China Relations. No: 12, Ankara December 2014.
- Regional Cooperation Possibilities and Prospects for the Future in the Caucasus. No: 11, Ankara December 2014.
- The Armenian-Azerbaijani Nagorno-Karabakh Conflict: A Threat to Regional Peace, Security and Neighborly Relations. No: 10, Ankara November 2014.
- Turkey-Iran: Regional Cooperation in an Evolving Eurasian Geography with a Focus on the Caucasus and Central Asia. No: 9, Ankara May 2014.
- Turkey's and Taiwan's Outlook on Eurasia-Pacific. No: 8, Ankara May 2014.
- Turkish-Armenian Dialogue. No: 7, Ankara April 2014.
- South East Europe, The Balkans: Prospects for the Region. No: 6, Ankara March 2014.
- The Caucasus and Azerbaijan. No: 5, İstanbul March 2014.
- Avrasya Perspektifleri: Kazakistan ve Türkiye'den Bakış. No: 4, Ankara February 2014.
- Turkey in the Troika of G-20, Preparing to Assume the Chair in 2015. No: 3, Ankara November 2013.
- A General Look at Asia and Turkey's Priorities: Prospects and Priorities of Turkey in Asia. No: 2, Ankara June 2013.
- Regional Integrated Transport Corridors Project. No: 1, Ankara, May 2013.



# **AVİM Reports**

- Osmanlı Devleti'ndeki Hukuki Düzenlemeler Çerçevesinde Ermeniler ve Geride Bıraktıkları Mallar (Emvâl-i Metruke). Prof. Dr. Gül Akyılmaz, No: 16, July 2017.
- Belgelerin Işığında Pontus Meselesi. Prof. Dr. Mesut Çapa, No: 15, June 2017.
- The Pontus Narrative and Hate Speech. Teoman Ertuğrul Tulun, No: 14, May 2017.
- Türkiye Cumhuriyeti/Osmanlı Devleti ve Ardıllık/Devamlılık Sorunsalının Görelileşmesi. Dr. Deniz Akçay, No: 13, May 2017.
- 81. Yılında Montrö Sözleşmesi'nin Karşılaştığı Güvenlik Sorunları ve Sözleşmenin Feshi ve Tadili İçin Girişimler Vukuunda Karşılaşılacak Senaryoların Analizi. E. Büyükelçi Dr. Şükrü M. Elekdağ, No: 12, April 2017.
- **Tarihsel Arka Planıyla Pontus Meselesi.** Yrd. Doç. Dr. Yüksel Küçüker Prof. Dr. Hikmet Öksüz, No: 11, April 2017.
- Uluslararası Hukukta Zarar Giderimi ve Ermeni Talepleri. Ertan Kiraz, No: 10, December 2016.
- "Cyprus V. Turkey" Kararı: Avrupa İnsan Hakları Mahkemesi'nin Uluslararası Hukuk ve Uluslararası Uyuşmazlık Sınavı. Deniz Akçay. No: 9, February 2016.
- The Armenian Terrorism and the Turkish Press (1973 1984). Hazel Çağan, No: 8, October 2014.
- Regional Security Complex Theory and the South Caucasus: Security Perceptions and Their Reflections on Regional Level. Özge Nur Öğütcü, No: 7, August 2014.
- Kör İnanç Olarak İntikamcılık ve Taşnak-ASALA Suikastleri. Hikmet Özdemir, No: 6, March 2014.
- Dünya Kiliseler Konseyi Nedir? Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun, No: 5, March 2014.
- Ermeni Apostolik Kilisesi'nde Yaşanan Anlaşmazlıklar. Mehmet Oğuzhan Tulun, No: 4, February 2014.
- 1915 Olayları ve Türk-Ermeni Uyuşmazlığı. No: 3, February 2014
- Avrasya'da Bölgesel Bir İşbirliği Mekanizması: Türk Konseyi. Ali Çiviler, No: 2 February 2014.
- Armenians and Syria 1915 and 2013. Jeremy Salt, No: 1, February 2014.